

****Lakṣaṇaṭīkā***
Sanskrit Notes on the *Catuhśatakaṭīkā* (5)*

YONEZAWA Yoshiyasu

The present paper deals with Sanskrit notes on Candrakīrti's *Bodhisattvayogācāra-Catuhśatakaṭīkā* (CŚT) chapters IX–XVI in the **Lakṣaṇaṭīkā* (*LT) (17b5–18b7)¹. The chapter titles and the textual studies (the critical Tibetan editions and the translations into modern languages) of the CŚT are as follows:

- IX: 'Showing the Realization of the Refutation of Permanent Things (*Nityārthaṭratiṣedha*; *dNgos po rtag pa dgag pa bsgom pa'i ting nge 'dzin bstan pa'*' Yamaguchi 1965; May 1980, 1981a, 1981b, 1982, and 1984.
- X: 'Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Self (*bDag dgag ba bsgom pa bstan pa*)' Uno 1983, Sasaki & Uno 1988, 1991, Uno 1998; and Ogawa 1988.
- XI: 'Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Time (*Dus dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)' Ogawa 1977.
- XII: 'Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Wrong Views (*lTa bar byas pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)' Tillemans 1990ab.
- XIII: 'Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Sense Faculties and Their Objects (*Indriyārthaṭratiṣedha*; *dBang po dang don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)' Tillemans 1990a and 1990b.

* Thanks are due to Dr. NIU Li Tao who contributed a lot to realize the research at the Potala Palace and the Tibet Museum in Lhasa for Taisho University. The present author is also indebted to the colleagues at Taisho University. Needless to say, responsibility of the present paper with any surviving errors rests entirely upon the present author.

¹ Concerning an overview of *LT, see Yonezawa 2014b.

XIV ‘Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Holding Extreme Positions (*mThar 'dzin pa dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)’ Katano 1980; Sasaki 1993, 1994, and 1996.

XV: ‘Showing the Realization of the Refutation of the Conditioned (*Samskr̥tartha-pratiṣedha*; *'Dus byas kyi don dgag pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)’ Johnson 2012.

XVI: ‘Showing the Philosophical Discussion between Master and Disciple (*Slob dpon dang slob ma rnam par gtan la dbab pa bsgom pa bstan pa*)

As in the previous papers (Yonezawa 2015, 2016, 2017 and 2018), the present paper attempts to collate the Sanskrit notes with CŚT which is available in Tibetan translation as well as in Sanskrit fragments. Concerning the extant portion of the Sanskrit text of CŚT, Suzuki 2004 is the primary source below. The present paper does not consult the Chinese translation of Dharmapāla’s commentary on CŚ (*Dasheng guang bai lun shi lun* 大乘廣百論釋論, T no. 1571) at all.

Although Sanskrit notes in *LT is comprised of very limited numbers of paraphrastical explanations, the brief text of the *LT presented below provides invaluable textual information about the CŚT. For instance, ‘tārkika-’ in CŚT (ad CŚ IX.1) is identified as Bhāviveka.

A Preliminary Transliteration

Symbols used:

‘	<i>virāma</i> , e.g., tat̄
« »	interlinear insertion
()	illegible (a part of) letter(s)
—	erased letter(s), e.g., न
{ }	superfluous letter(s)
+	one lost letter

[17b5]

kūṭe sāmagryān tiṣṭhatīti kūṭasthaḥ | sāmagryabhāvād anutpat्तिर ity arthaḥ | yatheva bhāvasya svabhāvas tathēvāgato buddhavān् yah sa tathāgatād ṛte nānyah | tathāgatām eva param् syāt | gata iti gantariktaḥ | vedanīyaṁ

[17b6] anubhavanīyaṁ | tair iti deśādviśeṣaiḥ | tārkikā bhāvivekādayaḥ | kārikāyāḥ kathitavyākhyānād anyataiva vyācakṣate | pareṇa tīrthikena | anutpannatvena nityatvena | utpannakāryarām | ghaṭādinā | kīrtir dūṣayati | svata eveti bhāvivekasya | parasya prasiddho yaṁ hetuḥ | tena mayāṅgikṛtam ity uktau cātiprasaṅgaḥ | aneneti hetunā | avidyamānam abhyupagamyataḥ svaprasiddhena bādhety akauśalam | asmād uktam eva sukhapratiपādyajñe=

[17b7] yaṁ | ṣaddhātūr ayaṁ puruṣapudgalā ity atrākāśasya kāraṇatvapratipādane pi notpannatvam uktaṁ | avayavatritayasyeti hetor iti śesah | parebhya iti tādarthe caturthī | viparitadarśī lokād anyathādarśī | ubhayam utpādabhaṅgo | sac ceti sadrūpaṁ | na pratipadyata iti vikṛta iti śeṣaḥ | āvattavyam iti kṛtibhave pi karma vivakṣate | tenāvasthā ity atra dvitīyā | sannikarṣaḥ sannidhiḥ | bhinnarām vināśitarām | bhinno yadi mokṣo 'sti tadā | yathāvad bhavate 'stivana=

[17b8] kāraṇamatis tathā moksasyāpi astitve kāraṇena bhāvyam | na cāsti | ato na tasmāj jāyata kiñcit kāryam | ato na tasyāstitive kāraṇam asti | bandho bhāvamātrām | nānartham iti kriyā | viśeṣaṇam | dvitīyavyākhyāne trayāt kāśātmo kā iti kiñciṇi vastu na jāyate iti viśeṣaḥ | kāraṇād iti mokṣaheto<r u>pāyāt | vaiparītyarām | praveṣaḥ | guneti sadvādayaḥ | teṣām hīti sāmīkhyānām | ṭṛṣṇasti tasyeti | mokṣāpasthāyām iti śeṣaḥ āma |

- [18a1] yo rogah | pūrvapakṣenety ārtha-pratiśidha-prakaraṇa eva
 sambandhatvāt pūrvaprakaraṇe kathitah | ātmāniśidhena ca
 sidhānta uttaraprakaraṇa eva prastutah | tena uttaraprakaraṇe
 kathitah || 9 || piriśāṅkitasya sarvathocchedadarśanāt | syād etad
 evam iti sambandhaḥ | pratitantraṁ pratiśāstraṁ |
 tatpratikūlapravṛttatvāt apakārī | ahinsā cābhypagamyate | atha
 cātmā śvāsvata iṣyate ity atra manyate kiṁ prakāraṇam |
 cakṣurādinā buddhya=
- [18a2] bhivyakteḥ sakāsāc cetanyavṛttir abhivyagta bhavati |
 cetanyavṛttātmikā ca kriyopabhuktir ucyate | yadi caitanyavṛttiḥ
 kryārūpā ātmānaḥ svarūpaṁ tadāsyā kriyāyā dharmeṇa bhāvyam |
 kriyā yathā calā na tathā dravyaṁ calaṁ | anyatra caisataneti
 rūpādvīṣaye centānā | Śakter anyatra cetānā | cetānā dhātoḥ prithag
 ity vyākhyā | etat prithakpravartanam ayuktam | yataś cetanetyādi |
 bijāmkurayor yathābhinnadeśatā | tathā cetanā dhātvor api
- [18a3] bhaviṣyatīty āha | pījetyādi | arīkura«ḥ» Śaktirūpabijāvasthāyām
 tirohitah paścadāvīrbhūtaḥ | manomātrasanyogād bhavatī
 manomātraṁ cetanyam | tattvātmasvarūparūpam | tadabhinnadeśam
 yatra viṣaye manah pravṛttarūpam taddesham | iva | ādhārane | aham
 śabdavācyātmā yadi sarvagataḥ | so ham iti mām kin na ceti |
 sarveśām eva cātmānām vyāpaka-tvāt | na ca paraśarīre
 mahātmana āvaraṇam iti sambandhaḥ | ekadeśatvāt parātmaiva
 svātmā | atho 'vaga=
- [18a4] myate ehir iti kṛtvā śrotrādayo buddhīndriyāṇi | ubhayātmakam
 manah | buddhi-karmendriyārūpatvāt | pāṣāṇḍāḥ sarvalīngināḥ || 10
 || anāgato vartamānatān na gacchaty anāgataḥ | atīto vartamānatām
 atikrānta ity atikramah | tābhyaṁ niyatavādinaḥ | svabhāvavādinaḥ
 | puruṣakārapuruṣavyāpārah | dvayavādo bhāva eva abhāva eva ceti
 | dvayavādān atikramah | dvayavādād atikramas tu nāsti | na
- [18a5] tasya nāstivam ity anena nāstivam pratiśiddham | astitvam api
 tathety ubhayarahitādvayavādah eva siddhiḥ |
 nāstivaniṣedhenānāgatadarśanaviruddham | astitvaniṣedhena
 cānāgata-vyapadeśo na virudhaḥ | na tv ity asya paśyanītyādinā
 sambandhaḥ | pūrvadharmaḥ dyānūtpannatvam | tenetyādi niyamena
 | rāgo raktāśreyah | raktasyānāgatasyābhāve rāgo nirhetukam syāt |
 samagrānām dharmaḥ sāmagryam tasya cāvastheva phalaṁ | tasyā
 eva utpatya=

- [18a6] bhyupagamāt | sahotpāda iti | smritinirvigalpayor iti śeṣah | tasyām
iti vartamānāvasthāyām «kārya»sampattih || 11 || ātmavaśād iti
svavaśah | prathamaḥ prathamaphalastha ityādi vyapadeśo nāsti
tīrthikānām dhruvaṁ | nāhyatra viśeṣah jagato netuh |
tathāgatasyāsato 'hamkāro sti yuktapudgalasya | sāradyaṁ
stambhitatvarṁ | utkālyamāna | utthāpyamānah | na vyāpadadyate | na
pratikṣepaṇi karoti | sīlavipattinām asaṅkheyaśatasasrair a=
- [18a7] pi na tulyaṁ | svāyattam iti dharmānām | aparāyattam iti
pudgalasya | viśesānamālebhati | nirvāṇam iva śāntyādi | kṛtenety
asmīn arthe kṛtiśam iti | avetya | avagamya | anvety asmāt kāryam
ity anvayaḥ kāraṇam | kṛcchra samīkaṇa | samvāda iti
mr̥dvādinoddeśādinā vā | sthūladarśanāḥ | saugatānām |
vihārādyupabhogam upalabhya viparyastadarśanāḥ santah |
saṃskṛtasya svapnādirūpadarśināḥ | kleśamalam avadhūya |
tathābhūtā eva ye
- [18a8] samāhitāstair avaseyāgamyāḥ || 12 || indhanam eva ced agnis tadā
nirindhana eva dīptah syāt | saṃcitetyādi sidhāntah | ālocanām
darśanām | vijñānasamudāya iti | cakṣuh srotrādijñānasamūhah |
adhyāropya svikṛtya | ayam iti tārkikah | padārtheti svabhāvatvarṁ |
vivakṣitah | ādiśabdena kathayitavyādi grāhyam | añjanam
nīlādītvenopalambhah | rūpaviṣaye indriyām rūpīndriyām |
cakṣurādi | rūpetyādi kāyendrayam
- [18b1] grāhyam ity antena | parābhimatam anūdyā | tad yadīty uktam |
dṛṣye padārthāntare utpanne dṛṣyatvarṁ nāma ghaṭavat
sāmānyaviśeṣah | netaraṭ paśyatītī akṣamāyām | darśanāc
cakṣuvispharanāt | cakṣurālocanām cakṣurvyaavalokanām |
graḥaṇeneti sahārthe tṛṭyā | athādrṣṭva gacchati | tathād iṣṭam
dravyām niyameneti vṛ̥thaiva jāyate | avaśyām darśanam
anupapatteḥ | yady aprāptakārtitvām nābhuyupagamyate | tadā
'gamavirodhah | sa ca prāptetyādinā
- [18b2] niṣiddhah | agatvety aprāpya | parāṇīty uṣṭāṇīti śeṣah | ādi
prathamaṁ mukhanigataṁḥ | paścāt kramena srotradeśam
prāpnoti | tasyeti mukhadēśasthasya | cakṣurādīndriyadvāraṁ
tiraskṛtaṁ paśya | asyeti cittasya | annantatvād
arthāvabodhasyānivṛttāv ātmasthānāgamane | saṃskārā«ḥ» karma |
sa eva pratyayah | ādinā nāmarūpaṁ | bāhyena pṛthivyādinā saha

- bāhyarāṁ rūparāṁ || 13 || āyattarāṁ | āyattatvāṁ | ātmatā svabhāvah | na
syur ity atra yadīti yojyarāṁ |
- [18b3] eka iti ekā sarinkhyā yadi ghaṭo na bhaveta | toato bhinna eva yadi
ghaṭa«ḥ» syāt tadā ghaṭo py eka iti nisidhyati | padārthabhedāṭ |
ekatvagunapadārthasya bhinnatvāṭ | yathādvitīyādi | naikarāṁ
tadvāṭ | samayor eva ghritatmadhuno sanyoge saty ekatvāṁ
nānyatra | ekasya sanyoga naisyate | gaṇe gaṇāntarābhāvāṭ | syāt
tattraivetyādi prāptam ity antarāṁ paravacanāṁ | rūpādiṣu madhye
ekaismiṇ् rūpādau ghaṭo nopalabhyate | ato bahutvam api ghaṭasya
nāsti | aparam ityādi
- [18b4] nāvyākhyānāntaram āha | śuklaḥ paṭo na bhavatīti guṇo guṇah
ghaṭo na bhavatīty arthaḥ | śuklalakṣaṇaprāptaḥ śuklasvarūpaṭāṁ
gataḥ | tadā ghaṭaḥ śuklatvam eva kevalāṁ na ghaṭaḥ | vikalpāḥ
viśeṣāḥ | nīlādiruprabhṛtayo tathā jñeyāḥ | sarveṣāṁ nīlādirūpāṇāṁ
sambandhābhāvena kvena rūpeṇa ghaṭaḥ paṭo bhavata |
sadasat bhyām iti | satvāsatvavikalpābhyaṁ
ekatvānyatvānyatvalakṣaṇaprāptatvenāvastutvāṭ | śuklaḥ śuklo na
bhavati
- [18b5] tathā paṭo pi paṭo na bhavatīti || 14 || bhinnarāṁ vikṛtarāṁ | na hy asatā
kiñcīt vikryate | dvābhyām iti sthitivināśabhyām | ekasyety utpattāḥ
| janmaśabdenotpādaḥ | asatbhāva iti | bhāvarūpasyeti śeṣaḥ |
nirodhānantarāṁ yo jātas tu prāgavasthā pūrvākotih | tata rūpo rtho
jātaḥ pragavasthārūpaḥ | etac ca yathā kathañcit
pracchādanamātrāṁ parasya | anumīyetety atra pareneti śeṣaḥ |
tasya tarhīti | jāyamānasya | jātajāyamā=
- [18b6] nayor abhedād ity arthaḥ | jāta evotpanna eva yadā jāyamāna ity
ucyate | tadā jāyamānah | bhasmād utpadyata ity ucyate | jāyata ity
asyānte ity arthaḥ syād iti yojyarāṇ | sa ca na yujyate | jāyamāno
'jāto yah sa jāta ity evam̄ kutah | prāgabhāvena | pūrvam
abhāvarūpatvena | naiva bhedābhāva iti | bheda evety arthaḥ | sace
ityādi siddhāntaḥ | akātarō bhavatīti kryā yojyā kiṁ bhūtaḥ
samutsāhita utpādita eko bijakṣaṇo yasya | tena ca punar a=
- [18b7] pi bhavam utpādayitum yuktaṁ || 15 || tasyām iti śūnyatāyām |
pañcadaśa ca parimāṇam eṣām iti tronna tvayā hīti parah | yasmāt
karaṇāt sam̄ jñā vidyate atah sadvastv astīti jñeyarāṁ || 16 ||
catuhśatakāṁ ||

A Tentative Edition

Explanatory Remarks

Both texts of *LT and CST are collated below, based upon the following rules:

- 1) The textual basis of the CST is as follows:
 - a) The Sanskrit text is taken from Suzuki 1994.
 - b) As for the parts where no Sanskrit text is available, the Tibetan text is used instead, based upon the critical editions included in Suzuki 1994, May 1982, 1984, Sasaki & Unno 1985, Uno 1998, Tillemans 1990b, and Johnson 2012 as well as the readings of the sDe dge edition in the case that no critical edition is available.
 - 2) The text of the CST is printed in a small font.
 - 3) The text of CST is underlined.
 - 4) The words of CST, which are picked up and briefly annotated in *LT, are printed in **Bold**.
 - 5) Emendations are shown in *Italics* except the following cases:
 - a) The correction of *sandhi* rules and *dandas*.
 - b) Quoted texts in so-called Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit.
 - 6) As the combination of 4) and 5), **Bold Italics** type of letters are used as well.
 - 7) Compounds are sometimes hyphened. To divide the vowel *sandhi*, underbar (_) is sometimes used for the sake of a layout.
- NB. The text below does not follow *sandhi* rules strictly.

Ad Chapter IX

[D. 145a3-158b2; C. 142a3-155a7; P. 161b1-175b4; N. 162b7-177b6.]

Ad IX.1

[Suzuki 1994: 164, 3–16] ata evoktaṁ bhagavatā |
 cakṣuh samṛddhe śūnyam ātmanātmīyena ca nityena dhruveṇa
 śāśvatena _avipariṇāmadharmeneti¹⁾ | tathā cakṣuś cakṣuśā śūnyam
 akūṭastha_avināśitām upādāya | tat kasya hetoh prakṛtiḥ asyaiṣet²⁾ ata eva ...tan
 mṛṣā moṣadharmaṇam yad^{..3)} etat saṃskṛtam ity uvāca sāstā |
 etac ca vacanam vakṣyamā[ṇa]yuktyupetaṁ tan niścītyācārya āha ||

tasmān munim rte nāsti yathābhāvas tathāgataḥ || [IX.1 (201) cd]

asaikṣyakāyavāñmanomaunayogān munir buddho bhagavān | sa evāṇītya-
 śūnyatopadeśena **yathā bhāvānām svabhāvas tathā gato** buddhas tathāgata ity
 ucyate | **nānyo** viparītatattvopadeśena yathāsthitatattvārthānabhisambodhāt |

1) *Samṛddhi-sūtra*, See May 1980: 218, fn. 7. 2) The *Śatasāhasrikā Prajñā-pāramitā*, see May 1980: 218, fn. 8. 3) MMK XIII.1a.

kūṭe sāmagryān tiṣṭhati_itि kūṭasthah | sāmagryabhāvād anutpattiḥ ity arthaḥ |
yathā_iva bhāvasya svabhāvas tathā_iva_āgato buddhavān yah sa
 tathāgatād ṣte nānyāḥ | tathāgatām eva param syāt | **gata** iti ganṭriktah |

Third Interpretation

[Suzuki 1994: 166, 10–13] athavā vedanātrayavedanīyakarmaṇām käladeśa_
 avasthāviśeṣasamvedyānām **tair** vinā karmaphalaśamvedanābhāvāt tadartham
 ādhyātmikanī bāhyam vā vastusambhavāt

sarvam kāryārtham utpannam [IX.1 (201) a]

na svarūpata eva vyavasthitām

tena nityam na vidyate [IX.1 (201) b]

vedanīyam^[6] anubhavanīyam | **tair** iti deśādiviśesaiḥ |

Fourth Interpretation

[Suzuki 1994: 168, 6–18] **tārkikās** tu **vyācakṣate** | **pareṇa** yat kāryārtham
anutpannatvena abhyupagatam tad **utpannam** kāryārthatvād **utpanna-**
kārya_arthavād iti | tad atrānudayavyayavatām parikalpitānām prthivy-
 ādiparamāṇūnām khapuṣpādivat tāvad astitvam āsthātum aśakyam | na
 ca **avidyamānānām** kāraṇatvam āropyotpādasiddhyā_anityatvasādhanām
 nyāyyam | kāryārthatvāsyā **svata eva_asiddhatvāt para-prasiddha-hetv-**
aṅgīkaraṇe cātiprasaṅgāt | ayuktavas tv abhyupagamāc ca parasya

nivāraṇīyatvān na yuktam nityam kāryārthatvenābhuyupagantum | na ca **anena** parapratijñāyā anumānavirodhodbhāvanam nyāyyam | tasyobhayaprasiddhenaivodbhāvanāt | yasyāpy ubhayaprasiddhenānumānabādhāsambhavāt **svaprasiddhena_apy** asty anumāna-**bādhā_itī** nūnam tasyāpy artha[pr]ati-pādāna_akaūśalam eva syāt | na hi vidvān **sukhapratipādyam** arthaṁ duḥkhena pratipādayitum ādriyate |

tārkikā Bhāviveka_ādayah | kārikāyāh kathitavyākhyānād anyatraiva vyācakṣate | **pareṇa** tīrthikena | **anutpannatvena** nityatvena | **utpannakāryam** ghaṭādinā | kīrtir dūṣayati | **svata eva_itī** Bhāvivekasya | parasya **prasiddho** 'yam **hetuh** | tena mayā_āngīkṛta ity uktau cātiprasaṅgaḥ | **anena_itī** hetunā | **avidyamānam** abhyupagamya tataḥ **svaprasiddhena bādhā_ity** akaūśalam | asmād uktam eva **sukha-pratipādyā-jñē^[7]yam** |

Fifth Interpretation

[Suzuki 1994: 168, 19– 170, 3] api cākāśasyāpi cakṣurviñānāñkurotpattau kāraṇatvābhidhānāt sūtrānte **śaddhātū-pāṭhāc** ca **pudgala-prajñaptinimittatvād** anaikāntikatvam eva syāt kāryārthatvasya ||

kāraṇam vikrtim gacchaj jāyate 'nyasya kāraṇam || [IX.9 (209) ab]

iti nyāyān nāsty **ākāśasya kāraṇatvam** iti cēn naitad evam |

śaddhātūr ayam puruṣa-**pudgala** ity atra_ākāśasya **kāraṇatva-pratipādane** 'pi notpannatvam uktam |

Sixth Interpretation

[Suzuki 1994: 172, 1–13] api ca vastuno lokasiddhatvāt tatsiddhāv anumāna-parigraho niḥprayojana eva | yo 'py ava[stu]no vastusattām mauḍhyāt pratipadyate so 'pi sāmānyajanaprasiddhyā śakyata eva vivakṣitam arthaṁ grāhayitum | vastutattvasādhane **ca_avayavatritayasya**_api sādhyavad asiddhatvād asambhava evārthasādhanasyety atas tārkikānām vyartha eva tarkaprāṇayanaśramo lakṣyate | tathā ca laukikā anādhītatarkalakṣaṇā api santo laukikārthaviniścayanipuṇā yad yathāsthitaṁ vastu tat tathaiva pratipadyante | **pratipādy[anti cā]parebhyāḥ** |

api cānīyatāyā lokapratitātvād yatra loko 'pi tām avasyati tatra na śakyata eva tad vaktum aviparītārthābhidhāyī tathāgata eveti | yas tu svalakṣaṇam āropya loko 'nityatām pratipadyamānas tasya vastuno mṛṣāmoṣadharmaṭatvena_apratipatteḥ sarvatra tathāgata eva **aviparītaradarśī_itī** yuktam |

avayavatritayasya_itī hetor iti śeṣah | **parebhyā** iti tādarthyē caturthī | **viparītaradarśī** lokād anyathādarśī |

*Ad IX-2**Against Vaiśeṣikas*

[Suzuki 1994: 172, 14–174, 17] atrāhur eke | satyam̄ yat kāryārtham utpannam̄ na tan nityam̄ bhavatīti | ye tu_ **ubhaya**_ aṅgavikalāḥ padārthas tad yathākāśādayo manahparyantāḥ | ye 'pi caikāṅgavikalāḥ padārthas tad yathā prthivyādiparamāṇavas te nityā bhaviṣyanti | teṣām̄ cāstitvanyatvānava-gamān nāviparītadarśī tathāgata iti | teṣām̄ matasyāyuktatām udbhāvayann āhācāryāḥ ||

apratītyāstītā nāstītī || [IX.2 (202) a]

yathāsvam̄ hetupratyayātto dayānām̄ [su]khādinām̄ astitvam̄ upalabhyā katham ayam arthāpattyāpratītyasamutpannānām̄ nāstitvam̄ na pratipadyeta | arhaty evāyam̄ sphuṭataram eṣām̄ gaganoṭpalādinām̄ ivāsattvam̄ pratipattum || tac cen **na pratipadyate** niyatam asya taimirikasyeva samā[r]opakṛtam darśanavaikṛtam upalakṣyata iti || ato

'pratītyāstītā nāsti' | [IX.2 (202) a]

sa caisa nyāyah kālavastudeśabhedabhinne padārthe sarvatrāvyabhicārīty āha ||

kadācīt kasyacit kvacit [IX.2 (202) b]

iti || yataś caitad evam ||

na kadācīt kva[c]it kaścid vidyate tena śāśvataḥ || [IX.2 (202) cd]

pūrvārdhena siddhasyaitan nigamanam | yadā caivam̄ apratītyasamutpannatvāt paraparikalpitānām̄ padārthānām̄ sattvanyatve na stas [ta]dā siddham̄ tathāgatasyāvīparītadarśītvam̄ tathā hi tena **sac ca** sato jñātām̄ yat pratiṣṭyasamutpannam | asac cāsataḥ paraparikalpitam apratītyasamutpannam̄ ceti |

ubhayam utpādabhaigau | **sac ca**_iti sadrūpam̄ | **na pratipadyata** iti vikṛta iti
šeṣāḥ |

*Ad IX-7**Against Kālavādins*

[May 1981: 92, 14–18] de'i phyir myu gu la sogs pa ltar 'bras bu nyid las mi 'da'o|| zhes bstan pa'i phyir|

des na 'bras bur yang 'gyur ro || [IX.7 (207) d]

zhes bya ba smos te| 'bras bur gyur pa ni myu gu la sogs pa bzhin du mi rtag pa kho nar 'gyur ro||

āpattavyam ('gyur ro?) iti kṛtibhave 'pi karma vivakṣate |

Ad IX-9

[May 1981: 94, 3–6] gal te dus smra ba rnams kyi ltar na dus 'di 'gro ba sna tshogsksyi rgyur 'gyur na ni de'i tshe **des** nges par **sngar gyi gnas** skabs las **tha dad pa'i** ngo bo can gyi rnam par 'gyur ba 'bras bu skye ba la phan 'dogs pa nyid du 'gyur bar bya dgos te| 'di ltar 'jig rten na|

kāraṇam vikṛtim gacchaj jāyate 'nyasya kāraṇam | [IX.9 (209) ab]¹⁾

1) Pras_LVP 398.3; Suzuki 1994: 170.1, see above.

tena (des)_avasthām (*gnas*) ity atra dvitīyā | **sannikarṣah** (*sngar gyi?*) sannidhiḥ | **bhinnam** (*tha dad pa'i*) vinaśitam |

Discussion about Nirvāṇa

Ad IX.20

[May 1982: 72, 3–6]

'ching dang bcing dang thabs las gzhan||

thar pa gal te yod na ni||

de las ci yang mi 'byung ste||

des na de thar zhes mi brjod|| [IX.20 (220)]

bhинно **yadi mokṣo 'sti** (thar pa gal te yod na) tadā | yathāvad bhavate 'sttive^[8] kāraṇamatis tathā mokṣasyāpi asttive kāraṇena bhāvyam | na cāsti | ato **na tasmāj jāyata kiñcit** (de las ci yang mi 'byung ste) kāryam | ato na tasyāsttive kāraṇam asti |

[May 1982: 72, 32–39]

des na de thar zhes mi brjod|| [IX.20 (220) d]

grol ba'i bya ba ni gang zhig **'ching ba** bcad pas bcing bar bya ba las grol ba nyid bden pa dngos po grol ba zhin pa bya ba dang ldn pa nyid yin la| de yang de nyid dang gzhan nyid du brtag pa dang bral ba na **don gzhan du ma gyur pa** yin na| thar pa ni don gzhan du gyur pa zhig yin pa 'di yod pa nyid du mi rigs so|| de'i phyir nyon mongs pa dang skye ba mi 'byung ba de byas so zhes bya bar brtag par mi rigs so||

bandho ('ching ba) bhāvamātram | **nānarthatam** (**don gzhan du ma gyur pa**) iti kriyāviśeṣanam |

[May 1982: 73, 11–20] [§ 8,4] gzhan dag ni|

'ching dang bcing dang thabs las gzhan||

thar pa gal te yod na ni||

de las ci yang mi 'byung ste||

des na de thar zhes mi brjod|| [IX.20 (220)]

zhes bya ba la **gtan tshigs de las** thar pa zhes bya ba cung zad kyang mi skye ste 'ching ba la sogs pa **gsum las** rnam par grol ba'i phyir brjod du med pa bzhin no|| des na rang bzhin log pas de la 'ga' zhig gis kyang **thar pa zhes** mi brjod do|| dam mi 'cha'o zhes bya ba'i don to|| zhes 'chad do||

dvitīyavyākhyāne trayāt (gsum las) kāśāt **mokṣa iti** (**thar zhes; thar pa zhes**) kiñcit vastu na jāyate iti viśeṣah | **kāraṇād** (**gtan tshigs de las**) iti mokṣahetor **upāyāt (thabs las)** | vaiparityam | praveśah |

Against Sāṃkhya

Ad IX.22ab

[May1984: 136, 24–137, 15] grangs can pa rnams ni **yon tan** dang skyes bu tha dad par shes pa las chan po la sogs pa'i 'jug pa'i rim pa log pas rnam par 'gyur ba'i tshogs rnam pa thams cad du zhi bas thar pa'i gnas skabs na skyes bu shes pa yod pa nyid gnas pa'i phyir bdag grol ba yod pa ma yin dang | ji skad brjod pa'i nyes pa spangs pas thar par rtog par byed do||
de dag gi de yang |

sred dang bral la thar ba'i tshe||

shes yod yon tan ci zhig yod|| [IX.22 (222) ab]

grol bar gyur pa'i skyes bu la ni thar pa'i gnas skabs na shes pa yod pa nyid yod par brtag par mi rigs so||

de dag gi ltar na blos lhag par zhen pa'i don la skyes bus shes par byed cing | shes pa yod pa nyid kyang me'i tsha ba nyid ji lta ba bzhin du de'i rang gi ngo bo'o zhes bya bar mnong par 'dod la| de yang yul ji ltar bstan pa yongs su gcod pa'i bdag nyid can yin no||

rang bzhin ni yul nye bar longs spyod pa'i 'dod pa rig cing skyes bu dang tha mi dad par rtogs nas rim gyis dbang po'i tshogs 'byung ba na skyes bu'i yul nye bar longs spyod pa'i rgyu yin no||

gang gi tshe yul nye bar longs spyod pa'i skyes bu la 'dod pa log pa de'i tshe de la **sred pa ldog go|| sred pa ni** 'dod pa yin la| sred pa dang bral ba de la ni shes pa yod pa nyid gyis yon tan 'ga' zhig yod pa yang ma yin no|| des ni de'i tshe don 'ga' yang yang dag par mi myong ste| rnam par 'gyur ba'i tshogs rgyu dang 'bras bu'i bdag nyid can mtha' dag rab tu zhi bar 'gyur ba'i phyir ro|| de'i phyir grol ba'i bdag la thar pa shes pa yod pa nyid mi rigs so||

guna (**yon tan, yon tan**)_iti satvādayah | **teṣām hi** (**de dag gi ltar na**)_iti Sāṃkhyānām| **ṭṛṣṇā** (**sred pa**)_asti tasya_iti |

Ad IX.23ab

[May1984: 137, 22–138, 6] [§ 9, 2] ci ste grol ba'i gnas skabs can shes pa yod pa nyid kyi nus pa yod pa'i phyir bdag yod do snyam du sems na 'di yang snying po med pa zhig ste| gang gi phyir|

thar pa bdag gcig yod na ni||

shes yod sa bon srid pa yod|| [IX.23 (222) ab]

gal te **grol ba'i gnas skabs su** bdag brtag par nus na ni de'i tshe bdag yod dang de'i rten can shes pa yod pa nyid kyi nus pa yod par 'gyur ba zhig na| de ni shes pa yod pa nyid kyi rang gi ngo bo can yin pa nyid kyi phyir de med par yod pa ma yin pas rten med pa'i nus pa yang mi srid do||

mokṣāvasthāyām (**grol ba'i gnas skabs su?**) iti śeṣah|

Conclusion of the Ninth Chapter

Ad IX.25

[Suzuki 1994: 188, 8–190, 7] yady evam muktāvasthāyām muktātmano 'py asadbhāvah sam[s]kārānām cāpunarutpattyā sarvathā parikṣayarūpam paramārthasamjñākaṇām nirvāṇām varṇyate tad alam anenedriṣena paramārthenārthitenety ata ātmakāmasya ||

varam laukikam evedam paramārtho na sarvathā|

laukike vidyate kimcit paramārthe na vidyate|| [IX.25 (225)]

naiva hy ātmakāmo locanāmayasampātaśāṅkayāksnor utpātanam anuṭiṣṭhati karoti tv āmaya_upaghātam eva | tathā saṃsāraduhkhodvignasya duḥkhamātratyāga eva jyāyān [|] na tu sarvathā sarvabhāvah | sarvābhāve hi sati sarvathā sukhasyāpy ucchittiyā na kiṃcid anenātmana upakṛtam bhavati |

āma^[18a1]**yo** rogah|

Notes on the Structure of the CŚT

pūrvapakṣena hy ārtha-pratiṣyidhaprakaraṇa eva sambandhatvāt pūrvaprakaraṇe kathitah | ātmaniṣedhena ca sidhānta uttaraprakaraṇa eva prastutah | tena uttaraprakaraṇe kathitah |

|| 9 ||

[End of the Chapter IX]

Ad Chapter X

[D. 158b2-171a4; C. 155a7-168a1; P. 175b4-189b4; N. 177b6-192a5.]

Ad X.1

[Suzuki 1994: 192, 3–10] atrāha| yady ātmā nāma kaścit svarūpataḥ syāt tasya
nirvāṇe **sarvathocchedadarśanāt** |

nāsm̄y¹⁾ aham̄ na bhaviṣyāmi na me 'sti na bhaviṣyati | [RĀ I.26ab]
iti |

na **pariśāṅkitasya syād evam̄**

varam laukikam evedam paramārtho na sarvathā |
laukike vidyate kimcit paramārthe na vidyate || [IX.25 (225)]
iti |

1) *nāsty* for *nāsm̄y* in the CŚT MS. See Suzuki 1994: 192, 5; 254, 4.

pariśāṅkitasya sarvathocchedadarśanāt | **syād** etad **evam̄** iti sambandhah |

[Suzuki 1994: 192, 10–22] na cātmā kaścit svarūpataḥ sambhavati | yadi hi syāt
sa niyatam̄ strīvena vā syāt puruṣatvena vā napuṁṣakatvena vā | tato 'nyasya
kalpanāntarasyābhāvāt | dvividhaṁ hy ātmānam̄ varṇayanti tīrthikā yad
utāntarātmānam̄ bahirātmānam̄ ca | tatrāntarātmā nāma yaḥ śārīrāgārāntar-
vyavasthitāḥ śārīrendriyasamghātasya tatra tatra pravartayitāntarvyāpāra-
puruṣo jagadāhaṁkāranibandhanāḥ kuśalādikarmaphalopabhoktā **prati-**
tantram anekavikalpabhedabhinnāḥ | bahirātmā tu dehendriyasamghātarūpo
'ntarātmāna **upakārīva** | tatra yas tāvad ayam antarātmā sa yadi strīvena
parikalpyeta tadā tasyājahatsvarūpatvāj janmāntaraparivarte 'pi
liṅgāntarāpratipattyā nityam eva strītvam̄ syāt | na caitad dr̄syate |
vyatyayopalabdheḥ strītvādīnām ātmaguṇatvābhāvāc [ca] |

pratitantram pratīśāstram̄ tatpratikūlapravṛttatvād **upakārī** |

Ahiṁśā and the Permanence of the Self

Ad X.6

[Sasaki & Uno 1985: 32, 2–11] yang gal te bdag 'di rtag par 'gyur na ni de
yongs su bsrung bar bya ba'i phyir mi 'tshe ba'i bdag nyid can gyo chos nye bar
ston par mi 'gyur te nam mkha' bzhin no|| mtshon rnon po dang me dang dug
dang | thog babs pa rnams kyis ni de'i spu yang 'gul bar mi nus so||
de nyid kyi phyir bshad pa|

mi 'tshe ba dang bdag rtag pa||

'di la rgyu ni ci yod snyam||

rnam pa kun tu'ang shing srin las||

rdo rje bsrung byar mi 'gyur ro || [X.6 (231)]
 ahinsā (mi 'tshe ba) cābhypagamyate | **atha** (gal te) ca_ātmā śāśvata (bdag
 'di rtag par) iṣyate ity atra manyate kiṁ prakāraṇam |

Against *Sāṅkhyā's Puruṣa*

Ad X.11ab

[Suzuki 1994: 206, 1–14] **atha** syāc caitanyaśaktirūpah puruṣas tasya
 cakṣurādi-karaṇavyāpārani-bandhana-buddhyabhivyakteś caitanyavṛttty-
 abhivyakter upabhoktā hi puruṣah || sa viṣaya_upabhukti-kriyā_abhinivṛttiyā
 viṣayam cetayate || sā hy asya viṣayopabhuktis caitanyavṛtttātmikā kriyā ||
 sā ca na vinā cakṣurādinā karaṇagrāmeṇa bhavatīti kuto 'syā vikāragrāmasya
 vṛthātvam iti |

ucyate | **yadi** caitanyaṁ caitanyavṛtti-svarūpam tadāsyā kriyāyā
dharma_anatikrameṇa bhavitavyam | kaś ca kriyāñām dharmaḥ ||
 dravyāśrayatvam calatvam ca | tathā hi ||

ā vināśāc calam nāma dravyam na asti kriyā yathā || [X.11 (236) ab]

dravyavyāpārārūpā hi kriyā || sā codayāt prabhṛty ā vināśāc **calā** | tathā hi
 vṛkṣādayah pavanādyupanipātam antareñānārabdhakriyās tiṣṭhanty avicalāḥ |
 kampanakriyā tv eṣā pavanādipratyayasampātād upajāyamānāvināśam calatām
 nātivartate |

cakṣurādinā buddhya^[2]bhivyakteḥ sakāśāc caitanyavṛttir abhivyaktā
 bhavati | **caitanyavṛttātmikā** ca kriyopabhuktir ucyate | **yadi** caitanya-
 vṛttih kriyārūpā ātmanah svarūpam tadāsyā kriyāyā dharmeṇa bhāvyam |
 kriyā yathā calā na tathā dravyam calam |

Ad X.12

[Suzuki 1994: 208, 11–17] api cāyam puruso yadi caitanyavyakteḥ pūrvam¹⁾
 caitanyaśaktirūpah syāt tadā ||

cetanādhātūr anyatra dr̄ṣyate 'nyatra cetanā' || [X.12 (237) ab]

caitanyasya dvirūpyakalpanāyām anyatra pṛthaktvena cetanāyāś **cetanādhātūś**
 cetanābijam cetanāśaktir dr̄ṣyate tvayā | **cetanā-śakteś** ca_anyatra pṛthak
cetanādhātōś cetanā **pravartamānā** cetanādhātusamānadeśā pravartate ||

1) Tib adds *shes pa 'di'i snga rol na.*

anyatra cetanā_itī rūpādīviṣaye **cetanā** | **śakter anyatra cetanā** |
cetanādhātōḥ pṛthag ity vyākhyā | etat pṛthak **pravartanam** ayuktam |

[Suzuki 1994: 208, 11–210, 3] api cāyam puruso yadi caitanyavyakteḥ pūrvam
 caitanya-śaktirūpah syāt tadā ||

cetanādhātūr anyatra dr̄syate 'nyatra cetanā | [X.12ab (237) ab]

caitanyasya dvirūpyakalpanāyām anyatra pṛthaktvena cetanāyāś cetanādhātūś
cetanā-bījam̄ cetanāśaktir dr̄syate tvayā | cetanāśakteś cānyatra pṛthak
cetanādhātōś cetanā pravartamānā cetanādhātusamānadeśā pravartate ||
dr̄ṣṭāntam āha ||

dravatvam iva lohasya_ity || [X.12 (237) c]

yathā loham̄ dravatām āpadyamānam̄ lohadēśa **abhinnadeśam** bhavati tadvat |
bījāñkurayo[r] hy **āvirbhāva-tirobhāvadarśanān** na samānadeśatā | na ca
puruṣasyāvirbhāvatirobhāvāt iti samānadeśa[tvā]m asti |

yataś **cetanā_ityādi** | **bījāñkuraylor** yathā **abhinnadeśatā** | tathā **cetanā-dhātōr** api ^[3] bhavisyatī āha | **bīja_ityādi** | **añkuraḥ** śaktirūpa-
bīja_avasthāyām **tiro-hitah** paścād **āvirbhūtaḥ** |

Ad X.13ab

[Suzuki 1994: 210, 10–212, 3] anye punar āhuḥ | naiva hy asmākam̄
caitanyarūpah pumān [|] kim̄ tarhi ||

caitanyam ca manomātre mahām̄ cākāśavat pumān || [X.13 (238) ab]

ātmā hi pratiśāriṇam̄ sarvaprāṇabhr̄tām̄ ākāśavad vibhuḥ [|] tasya ca
manomātrasamyuktā cetanā na sarvavyāpiṇī | manaś cātmānaḥ paramānu-
mātrapradeśasamyuktam [|] tena **manasā** samyujya puruṣas **tadabhinnadeśam**
caitanyam utpādayati | tataś ca yathoktadoṣānavasaro 'samatpakṣa iti |

ucyate | yata eva hy ākāśavad atimahataḥ puruṣasya manomātre caitanyam
abhyupeyate | nanu tvayā ||

acaitanyam tatas tasya svarūpam iva dr̄syate || [X.13 (238) cd]

manomātrasamyogād bhavati **manomātram** **caitanyam** | tattvātma-
svarūpam | **tadabhinnadeśam** yatra visaye **manah** pravṛttam̄ taddeśam | **iva** |
ādhāraṇe |

Ad X.14

[Suzuki 1994: 212, 10–214,7] yadi cāyam ātmā pratisattvam̄ sarvagataḥ syāt
tadā ||

para[s tv aveti] kim na aham aham sarvagato yadi | [X.14 (239) ab]

yadi tāvakiyā kalpanāyāham̄ sarvagataḥ sarvavyāpī syām ākāśavat tadā
sattvāntare 'py madātmanāḥ sadbhāvāt kim̄ iti tasya tasmin mamevāhaṅkāro
notpadyate | evam̄ hy asya sarvagatavam̄ yujyate yadi mameva parasyāpi
madātmani syād ahaṅkāraḥ | **na ca** parātmanāsyā **madātmanāḥ** paraśārīre
yuktam **āvaraṇam** | na hi parātmadeśe 'smadātmāno 'sadbhāvah̄ sarvātmanām̄
vyāptivābhupagamāt |

yadā ca samānadeśatā tadā na tena tasyāvaraṇam śakyam kartum iti
pratipādayann āha ||

tēnaivāvaraṇam nāma na tasyaivopapadyate || [X.14 (239) cd]
iti ||

samānadeśat[vā]t svātmasvarūpasyeva **svātmanā** nāsty āvaraṇam ity
ahaṅkāravिशयत्वम् **parātmano** 'pi prasajyate | na tv evam bhavafti na
sarvagata ātmā |

aham śabdavācyā_ātmā yadi sarvagataḥ | so 'ham iti mām **kin** na ceti |
sarvesām eva cātmanām vyāpakatvāt | **na ca paraśarīre madātmana**
āvaraṇam iti sambandhah | ekadeśatvāt **parātma**_eva **svātmā** |

Against *Sāṅkhya's Prakṛti*

Ad X.15

[Suzuki 1994: 214, 10–216, 5]

yesām gunānām kartṛtvam acaitanyam ca sarvaśāḥ |
teśām unmattakānām ca na kimcid vidyate 'ntaram || [X.15 (240)]

sattvarajastamāṇsi trayo guṇāḥ || teśām sāmyāvasthā pradhānam
prasavāvasthā prakṛtiḥ | sedāniṁ triguṇātmikā prakṛtir acetanāpi satī puruṣasya
viditaviśayopabhogautsukyāt puruṣenābhedyam pratipadya sakalam
vikāragrāmam prasūte | tatra cāyam kramah || yad uta || prakṛter mahān ||
mahān iti buddheḥ paryāyah | mahato 'haṅkārah || sa ca trividhah || sāttviko
rājasas tāmasa iti || tatra sāttvikād ahaṅkārāt pañca **buddhīndriyāṇi śrotraṁ**
tvak cakṣū rasanām ghrāṇam iti | pañca **karmendriyāṇi** vāk pāṇi pāda
pāyūpasthākhyāni | **ubhayātmakam** ca **mana** ity ekādaśa pravartante | rājasād
ahaṅkārāt pañcatanmātrāṇi śabdasparsarūparasagandhāḥ | tanmātrebhyo
bhūtāny ākāśavāyutejojalapṛthivyākhyāni | tāmasas tv ahaṅkārayoh pravartaka
ity evam prakṛtivikārāt patvāt sakalasya vikāragrāmasya trayo guṇāḥ
pravartakā ity evam yeśām vādinām gunānām kartavyam acaitanyam cety
abhiprāyah |

atha 'vaga^[4]myate ebbhir iti kṛtvā **śrotra**_ādayo **buddhīndriyāṇi** |
ubhayātmakam manah | buddhi-**karmendriya**-rūpatvāt |

Against the Supreme Self

Ad X.20

[Uno 1998:3–8] gzhan yang **ya mtshan can** thams cad kyis bdag tu 'dzin pa
dang | bdag gir 'dzin pa rnam pa thams cad du zad par bya ba'i phyir grol ba
khas blangs te| de'i phyir de dag la grol ba'i gnas skabs na|

gal te bdag ces bya yod na||

bdag med snyam ste mi rigs shing||
de nyid rig pa nges sdom las||
mya ngan 'das 'gyur zhes bya'ang brdzun|| [X.20 (245)]
pāśāṇḍāḥ (ya mtshan can) sarvalīṅginah |

[End of the Chapter X]

Ad Chapter XI

[D. 171a4-183a6; C. 168a1-180a4; P. 189b4-202b7; N. 192a5-206a5.]

Ad XI.1

[D 171b5-172a2]

ma 'ongs bum la¹⁾ da ltar ba'i||
bum yod ma yin 'das pa med||
gang phyir de gnyis ma 'ongs pas||
de phyir ma 'ongs yod ma yin|| [XI.1 (251)]

ma 'ongs pa'i dus nye bar mtshon par bya ba'i don du ma 'ongs pa'i bum pa nye
 bar bkod la| de bzhin du 'das pa dang da ltar byung ba'i dus nye bar mtshon pa'i
 don du 'das pa dang da ltar byung ba'i bum pa nye bar bkod do|| de ltar **ma 'ongs**
pa ni da ltar byung ba'i dus sum **phyin pa'o|| 'das pa ni** de nyid las **'das pa'o||**
 da ltar byung ba ni skyes la ma 'gags pa'o|| da ltar ba ni da ltar dmigs pa'i phyir
 gtso bo yin gyi| der ma 'ongs pa dang rgal bdag gis ma 'ongs pa dang 'das pa'i
 dus nyis rnam par 'jog pa ni gtso bo ma yin no||

dus gsum po de dag kyang phan tshun ltos pa nyid du gnas te| gnyis gnyis la
 ma ltos par re re med pa'i phyir ro|| 'das pa dang da ltar gnyis la ma ltos pa ni
 ma 'ongs pa'i dus rnam par gzhag par mi nus te| ma 'ongs pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i
 rang gi ngo bos de gang du ma 'ongs pa 'das pa dang da ltar gyi dus gnyis po
 der gdon mi za bar 'gyur dgos so|| de med na ni gang du ma 'ongs ba las 'di ma
 'ongs pa nyid du 'gyur| dus gzhan gnyis kyi rnam par gzhag pa yang de dang
 'dra bar sbyar bar bya'o²⁾

1) *la* for *pa*. See Ogawa 1977: 44, n. 17. 2) Cf. MMK XIX.1-4. See Ogawa 1977:
44, n. 19-20.

anāgato vartamānatān na gacchati (ma 'ongs pa ni da ltar byung ba'i dus sum
phyin pa'o)_ity anāgataḥ | **atīto vartamānatām atikrānta** ('das pa ni de nyid
 las 'das pa'o) ity atikramah tābhȳām []

Ad XI.9

[Suzuki 1994: 226, 17–228, 8]

yah paścāj jāyate bhāvas sa pūrvam vidyate yadi |
na mithyā jāyate pakṣas teṣām niyatīvādinam || [XI.9 (259)]

ya utpādāt prāgavastho bhāvo hetupratyayaiḥ paścāj jāyate sa yady utpādāt pūrvam svarūpato 'stī kalpyata evam sati niyatīvādinām pratiniyatasvabhāvam nirhetukam **puruṣakāra**-śūnyam upapattiviruddham jagad varṇayatām nābhuyupagamo mithyā syāt | na ca na mithyā teṣām vādas tatpaksasya drstādrstavirodhāt || puruṣakārānapekṣatvāt teṣām jagat-praṭītyasamutpādābhāvah || tadabhāvāc ca kharaviṣāṇavat sarvam jagad agrāhyam syād ity ayukto niyatīvādaḥ |

tābhāyām **niyatavādinah** svabhāvavādinah | **puruṣakārah** puruṣavyāpārah |

Ad XI.11

[Suzuki 1994: 230, 18–232, 16] vastusatpadārthavādino hi yāvat tasya vastuno 'stītvam tāvat tathā svarūpasyaiva | [yadā padārthasvarūpānādīgamas] tadāsyā tad vastu sarvathābhāvāt kharaviṣāṇaprkhyam iti **dvayavādānatikramād** asya sarvam evābhīsamīhitam durghatam jāyate |

niḥsvabhāvavādinas tu sarvathā vastusvarūpasyāsambhavād bhāvakalpanā dūrotsāritā | yena hy utpattavyam **na tasya nāstītvam** || yadi hy asya nāstītvam syāt tadāsyā kharaviṣāṇādīvad utpādo na syāt | athāsyā **astītvam** syāt tadā vartamānasyevotpādo na syād asti cāsyotpāda iti **siddho** 'yam **advayavādāḥ** | yata evāsyā **nāstītvam** nāsti tata eva **anāgatavyapadeśo** 'pi sidhyati | eṣa ca laukiko vyavahāro na paramārtha iti nātraikāntenopapattir avatāryate |

buddhānām bhagavatām yad anāgate jñānam tat pūrvapraṇidhāna_ adhiṣṭhānākṣiptayathārthapratiṣṭhānaśabdaśrutibalaḍhānāt tathāvidhadharmaśravaṇasamvartanīyakarmavīśeṣaprabhāvapariṇatavijñānasantānās tathākāra_ anuviddhavijñānodayās tathāgatādhiṣṭhānāt ta[m a]rthaṁ pratipadyamānā yathārthaṁ pratipadyante | kālāntareṇa ca tam arthaṁ vartamānībhūtam tathaivāvagacchantī evam anāgate buddhānām jñānam vyavasthāpyate | **na tu pūrvadharma**-svabhāvavyavasthitās te kiṃcīt **paśyant** udāharanti cety alam prasaṅgena |

dvayavādo bhāva eva abhāva eva ceti | **dvayavādānatikramah** | dvayavādād atikramas tu nāsti | **na** ^{5} **tasya nāstītvam** ity anena nāstītvam pratiṣiddham | (... **astītvam** api tathā^{...1)}_ity ubhayarahita **advayavādā** eva **siddhiḥ** | **nāstītvā-niṣedhena** **anāgatadarśana-viruddham** | **astītvā-niṣedhena** ca **anāgatavyapadeśo** na virudhah |

na tv ity asya paśyanti_ityādinā sambandhaḥ | pūrvadharma_ādyanutpannatvam |

(1) The reading of the CŚT might have been *tathāpy astitvaṇi* for *athāsyāstitvam*.

Ad XI.12

[Suzuki 1994: 236, 1–3] **athāsyā tena niyamena** tasya dharmasya kaścid višeṣo
niśpādyate sa eva višeṣah pūrvam asan paścāt kriyata iti vyāhanyate 'sya tarhi
sadbhāvavāditvam iti pratipādayann āha ||

tena_ityādi niyamena |

Ad XI.14cd

[D 177a4–7]

chags med par yang 'dod chags ni||

de ltar yin dang 'byung bar 'gyur|| [XI.14 (264) cd]

ma 'ongs pa med na rnam par shes pa skye'o zhes bya bar mi 'gyur te| rnam par
shes pa ni ma 'ongs pa nyid kyi phyir yod pa ma yin no|| de ltar yin dang rten
med pa'i skye ba'i bya ba mi 'byung ngo||

de bzhin du **chags pa'i rten can 'dod chags** kyang skye ba'i bya ba bzhin rten
gzhan gyi dbang yin te| de chags pa med par 'dod na rgyu med pa can nyid du
'gyur na| **rgyu med pa can** ni srid pa yang ma yin te| dgra bcom pa la yang 'dod
chags yod par thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir ro|| de'i phyir rgyu med pa can gyi skye
ba med do||

gang gi tshe skye ba rgyu med pa can mi srid pa de'i tshe ma 'ongs pa med pa
nyid du mi rigs so|| yang gi sgras ni chags pa med par yang 'dod chags su 'gyur
ba'am| yang na ma 'ongs pa med pa ma yin no zhes bya bar rnam par rtog pa'i
don to||

rāgo raktāśrayah (chags pa'i rten can 'dod chags) | **raktasya_anāgatasya_abhāve rāgo nirhetukam** (rgyu med pa can) syāt |

Ad XI.15 Vaibhāsika View

[D 177b4–5] bye brag tu smra ba pa yang rang bzhin ma byung ba las 'byung
bar thal bar 'gyur bas 'jigs pas dus gsum char du yang yod pa nyid du rtog cing
tshogs pa yang gnas skabs kyi 'bras bu can yin gyi| rdzas kyi 'bras bu can ma
yin pas dus gsum kar rnam par gnas pa'i rang gi mtshan nyid kyi rdzas ni rgyu
dang rkyen gyi tshogs pas da ltar ba'i gnas skabs tsam zhig tu byed kyi| snga na
med pa'i rdzas bskyed pa ma yin no snyam du sems so||

samagrāñāṁ dharmaḥ sāmagryam(tshogs pa) tasya ca_avasthā (gnas skabs)_eva phalam ('bras bu) | tasyā eva utpattyā^[6]bhyupagamāt | sahotpāda iti |

Ad XI.25

[D 182b4–5]

mthong zin dngos po mi snang zhing||
 slar yang sems skye min des na||
dran pa zhes bya log pa yi||
don la log pa kho na 'byung|| [XI.25 (275)]

da ltar ba'i gnas skabs kyi dngos po de'i rang gi ngo bo dngos su byed pa'i shes
 pa da ltar bas mthong ba gang yin pa de ni slar mi snang ngo||
 smṛti (dran pa)-nirvikalpayor iti śesah | tasyām iti vartamānāvasthāyām (da
 ltar ba'i gnas skabs) kāryasampattiḥ

{End of the Chapter XI}

Ad Chapter XII

[D. 183a6-195a4; C. 180a4-192a3; P. 202b7-216a1; N. 206a5-220b1.]

Ad XII.1?

[Tillemans 1990b: 3, 9–17]

smra po'i yon tan rnam gzhan du||
 mi 'gyur nyan pa po la'ang min|| [XII.1 (276) cd]

§5. de la smra ba po'i yon tan dag ni zur dod pa dang phyin ci ma log pa dang |
 gsal ba dang ma 'khrugs par brjod pa dang | nyan pa po'i lhag pa'i bsam pa
 khong du chud pa dang | sems la zang zing med pa nyid de| de lta bu la sogs pa
 dag go|| nyan pa po yang chos dang chos smra ba po gnyis la gus pa dang | yid
 gtong pa nyid dang | gzu bor gnas pa nyid dang | blo dang ldan pa nyid dang |
 don du gnyer ba nyid do|| de'i don du gnyer ba nyid ni chos dang chos smra ba
 dag la gus par byed pa dang yid gtod pa nyid la sogs (...**bdag gis**...) rtogs par
 byed do||

(1) Tillemans 1990b reads *pa dag*.

ātmavaśād (bdag gis) iti svavaśah |

Ad XII.4

[Suzuki 1994: 246, 1–10] nanu ca yadi sarvapāśāṇḍīnām apy ayam evābhīprāyo yad uta sarvatyāgena nirvāṇam iti kaḥ punar bhavatas **tīrthikānām** ca viśeṣah | ayam višeṣo yat tīrthikānām sarvatyāgābhīprāyamātram na tu punaḥ sarvatyāgopāyākhyānam |

anupadiṣṭe ca sarvatyāgopāye ||

kim karisyati sa tyāgam tyāgopāyām na vetti yah || [XII.4 (279)ab]

sarvatyāgāśaye 'pi sthitas tīrthikamatāvalambī tyāgopāyānabhijñah kim tyāgam karisyati | yan na jānāti sarvadharmaśvabhāśūnyatālakṣaṇam sarvatyāgopāyām paramārthaśatyam ata eva ||

śivam anyatra nāstīti nūnam tenoktavān munih || [XII.4 (279) cd]

ihaikaḥ **prathama**-śramaṇa iha dvitīyo yāvac caturthah | śūnyāḥ parapravādāḥ śramaṇair ity amunaivābhisaṃḍhīnā muninaivam uktam iti niścīyate |

prathamaḥ prathamaphalastha ityādi vyapadeśo nāsti **tīrthikānām** dhruvam |

Ad XII.7

[Suzuki 1994: 256, 1–8]

gantum notsahate netuh prsthato 'py asato manah || [XII.7 (282) cd]

na kevalam **asatām ahaṅkāramamakāravyavasthitānām** svayam eva nirvāṇam gantum mano notsahate || api khalu yathopavarṇitasya netuh prsthato 'py asyāsato nirvāṇam mano notsāham pravedayate | kasmāt punar asya netuh prsthato 'py asataḥ **pudgalasya** nirvāṇam gantum mano notsahate || śūnyatāyām trāsāt |

na hy atra višeṣah jagato **netuh** | tathāgatasya **_asato 'hamkāro** 'sti yukta-pudgalasya |

Ad XII.8

[Suzuki 1994: 258, 1–4] rajjvām upajātasarpaviparyāsasya rajjudarśane sati sarpabhayāpagamavat | yas tu kiṃcij jānāti tasya niyamenāvāsyambhāvitayā trāso vidhīyate | na hi suśikṣito mattagajāvāhako hastiny **utkālyamānas** tato bibheti | nāpi tadvāhanotsuko'tyantamūrko grāmīnah | sa hi tatpātādidoṣadarśanādvāhanam eva bahu manyamāno na tato bibheti | kiṃcijjñas tv atitarām bibhety ātmanas tadāsanāparijayaṁ manyamānah | api khalu sarvakāryeṣ evam pravṛttau kiṃcijjñasya niyatam trāso bhavati | na vidiitatattvasya **vaiśāradya** | nāpy atyantānabhijñasya mohasaṃḍhāritatvāt | kiṃcidjñas tu trasyati kim etac chakyam na śakyam iti vimarśotpādāt ||

vaiśāradya stambhitatvam | **utkālyamāna** | utthāpyamānah |

Ad XII.11

[Suzuki 1994: 262, 8–18] tad asya tathāgatasya vacasah sopapattikatām udbhāvayann ācārya āha ||

śilena gamyate svargo drṣṭyā yāti param padam ||| [XII.11 (286) cd]
iti ||

Śilavipattir hi sūpacīyamānamṛdumadhyādhimātrakramāñām pretatiryainnarakopapattiphalā vipākeyattāparicchedena pravartate | yadi ākrāntasamyagdarśaneś āryeṣu **na vyāpadyate** | Śilaviśuddhis tv anākrāntasamyagdarśanānām pṛthagjanānām prakarṣena svargaphalā | darśanavipattis tu mṛdutarā cet sāpy **asamkhyeyaśatasahasrair** api **Śilavipattinām** aśakyā vipākamahattayā samīkartum api prāg eva jetum |

na vyāpadyate | na praktikṣepam karoti | **Śilavipattinām asamkheyasatasahasrair** a^[7]pi na tulyaṇ |

Ad XII.13

[Suzuki 1994: 268, 14–270, 16] **svāyattam aparāyattam** nijam akrtakarūpam nāstīti **pudgalasya dharmāñām** ca naiḥsvābhāvyṃ vyavasthāpyate |

yasya cārthasya svarūpasiddhir nāsti tasya kenānyenātmanāstu siddhir iti | sarvathāsiddhasvalkaṇā eva padārthā visamvādakenātmanā pratītya vopādāya vā vartamānā mūḍhadhiyām saṅgāspadām sambhavanti | yathāsvabhāvaṁ tu samyagdarśanaiḥ pratibhāvyamānā dharmapudgalayoḥ [saṅgapariksayaṁ āvahanti] [] saṅgapariksayaś ca **nirvāṇa**_avāptikāraṇam []

nairātmyam advitīyam śivadvāram bhavati | nirvāṇapurapraveśaya ekam evāsaḥāyam etad dvāram | yady api śūnyatānimittpañihitākhyāni trīṇi vimokṣamukhāni | tathāpi nairātmyadarśanam eva pradhānam [] vidita-nairātmyasya hi bhāveṣu parikṣīṇasaṅgasya na kvacit kācit pṛarthanā kuto vā nimittopalambha ity advitīyam eva śivadvāram etan nairātmyam |

tac caitat kudṛṣṭinām bhayaṅkaram [] kutsitā drṣṭayāḥ [kudṛṣṭayāḥ] | nairātmye hi vastunaḥ sarvathānupalambhāt kudṛṣṭinām vastusvarūpa-parikalpasamāśrayaṇāt bhayaṅkaram etan nairātmyam []

viṣayaḥ sarvabuddhānām nairātmyam | sarvabuddhānām iti śrāvaka-pratyekabuddhānuttarasamyaksambuddhānām [] jñānaviśeṣaviṣayatvena_ avasthānād viṣayaḥ sarvabuddhānām ity ucye | dharmaśarīrāvyatireka-vartitām vā sar[ve]ṣām samyaksambuddhānām āvedayann āha viṣayaḥ sarvabuddhānām iti | viṣeṣaṇamālayā nairātmyam uktam ācāryena []

svāyattam iti **dharmāñām** | **aparāyattam** iti **pudgalasya** | **viṣeṣaṇamālā**_iti | **nirvāṇam** iva Śāntyādi |

Ad XII.15

[Suzuki 1994: 272, 16–19]

vādasya kṛtaśo dharmo nāyam uktas tathāgataih || [XII.15 (290) ab]
 [yadi cāyam] dharmo vādasya **kṛtena** upadiṣṭaḥ syāt syād etad evam [] na tv
 ayam vādārtham upadiṣṭo vimokṣamukhenopadeśāt |
kṛtena_ity asminn arthe **kṛtaśa** iti |

Ad XII.16

[Tillemans 1990b: 48, 11–16] mya ngan las 'das pa ni gtan du ba'i 'jig pa yin la
 der rjes su 'jug pa'i sgo ni rnam par thar pa'i sgo stong pa nyid rtogs pa'i bdag
 nyid can yin la bstan pa'i chos kyang slob dpon la de dang 'dra bar snang stel ji
 ltar 'phags pa'i chos kyi rang bzhin **thugs su chud par** shes nas dad pa dang
 ldan pa lta ba gzhan mngon par mi 'dod pa de bzhin du lung gi chos rtogs pa
 yang gzhan la mi dga' snyam du dgongs so||
avetya (**thugs su chud par**) avagamya | anvety asmāt kāryam ity anvayah
 kāraṇam |

Ad XII.18

[Tillemans 1990: 49, 13–10 §62. dngos por lta ba la mngon par zhen pa'i mu
 stegs can mya ngan las 'das pa la **gYang sar** 'du shes pa rnams ni mya ngan las
 'das pa las 'jig rten gcod par byed cing skye bo sdug bsngal mtha' yas pa'i rgyu
 dngos por lta ba la sbyor ba na 'gro ba rnams kyi sdug bsngal mu mtha' med
 pa'i sa bon du gyur pa yin no|| de'i phyir|

brijabhbūtān anarthaśaya drstvā tīrtakarān bahūn |

na bhavet kasya kārunyam dharmakāmesu jantuṣu || [XII.18 (293)]¹⁾

[Tillemans 1990: 50, 12–18] §64. yang ci'i phyir sems can rnams dge ba'i bsam
 pa can yin yang phal cher mu stegs can rnams kyi **lugs** dang rjes su 'brel gyi
 bde bar gshegs pa'i dang ma yin zhe na| de ni phra ba'i phyir ro|| 'di ltar **rags pa**
mthong zhing | **bde bar gshegs pa pa rnams kyi gtsug lag khang** dang kha
 zas dang chos gos la sogs pa mchog tu gyur pa **dmigs nas lta ba phyin ci log**
pa rnams de bzhin gshegs pa'i gsung rab kyi don zab mo mkhlas shing mdzangs
 pas rig par bya ba'i gting mi dpogs shing mthong ba dang thos pa tsam gyis
 bslus pa na mu stegs can rnams kyi gzhung lugs dag la gus par byed do||

1) Kuranishi 2012: 1273. (See Yonezawa 2015: 83, fn. 1.)

kṛcchra (?**gYang sar**) samkāṭa | **samvāda** (lugs?) iti mṛdvādinā_uddeśādinā vā |
sthūladarśanāḥ (rags pa mthong) | **saugatānāṁ vihāra** (bde bar gshegs pa pa
 rnams kyi gtsug lag khang)_ādyupabhogam **upalabhyā** (dmigs nas)
viparyastadarśanāḥ (lta ba phyin ci log pa rnams) santah |

Ad XII.19

[Tillemans 1990: 51, 12–52, 6] §66. śā-kya dngos po thams cad rang bzhin med par lta ba'i nyi mas sems kyi rgyud snang bar byas shing dam pa ma yin pa'i lta ba ma lus pas 'thibs shing tshang tshing du gyur pa'i ma rig pa'i mun pa bcom pa| 'dus byas rmi lam dang mig 'phrul dang sgyu ma'i na chung dang gzugs brnyan dang sprul pa dang mtshungs par mthong ba| nyon mongs pa'i dri ma ma lus pa bsal bas sems kyi rgyud dri ma med par gyur pa rnams ni de ltar mnyam par gzhag pa dag kho nas nges par bya ba yin te| de'i phyir de dag gi dge ba'i bsam pa ni yid kyi rnam par shes pas go bar bya ba yin pas thub pa'i gzhung lugs phra ba yin no|| de'i phyir ma nges pas bsod nams 'dod kyang skye bo bde bar gshegs pa'i chos la mi 'jug go ||

samskṛtasya ('dus byas) svapna (rmi lam)_ādirūpa-darśināḥ (mthong ba) | kleśamalam (nyon mongs pa'i dri ma) avadhūya (bsal bas) | tathābhūtā eva (de ltar ... kho nas) ye ^[8] samāhitāḥ (mnyam par gzhag pa dag) tair avaseyā (nges par bya ba yin te)_āgamyāḥ |

|| 12 ||

/End of the Chapter XII/

Ad Chapter XIII

[D. 195a5-209a1; C. 192a3-206a1; P. 216a2-230b5; N. 220b1-236b5.]

Ad XIII.1

sarva eva ghato 'drsto rüpe drste hi jāyate |
brūyat kas tattvavin nāma ghataḥ pratyakṣa ity apy || [XIII.1 (301)]¹⁾

[Tillemans 1990: 62, 17–63, 5] §5. gang zhig gzugs la sogs pa las ma gtogs par bum pa gzhan du ma dmigs pa'i phyir gnas skabs de lta bu'i gzugs la sogs pa dag kho na la bum pa'i blor 'gyur gyi bum pa zhes bya ba dngos po 'ga' zhig yod pa ni ma yin no snyam du sems pa de ltar rgol ba de'i ltar na rtag tu 'bar ba nyid la sogs pa'i nyes bar thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir bud shing las ma gtogs par las med par gyur pa'i me'i yod pa nyid med pas de yang blos yongs su brtags pa tsam du 'gyur la| de bzhin du 'byung ba rnams dang sems dang sems las byung ba rnams phan tshun med par 'byung bar ma grub pa'i phyir bum pa

bzhin du blos brtags pa tsam nyid du 'gyur zhing rang gi ngo bos 'grub par mi 'gyur na| 'di ni de ltar 'dis khas blangs pa yang ma yin no|| . . .

1) Pras_LVP: 71, 6–7; Pras_M: 269, n. 1.

indhanam (bud shing) eva ced **agnis (me)** tadā nirindhana eva **dīptah** ('bar ba nyid) syāt |

[Tillemans 1990: 64, 19–66, 4] §11. gal te rnam par shes pa'i tshogs lnga ni **bsags pa'i** rten dang dmigs pa can yin pas dbang po'i rdul phra rab dang yul gyi rdul phra rab re re zhing rten nyid dam dmigs pa nyid du rtogs pa ma yin te| rab rib can gyis skra shad re re logs su ma **mthong ba'i** phyir ro|| tshogs pa'i nang na gnas pa re re yang rgyu'i dngos po yin pa ltar mig la sogs pa'i rdul phra rab gtshogs pa rnams ni re re zhing rgyu nyid yin no zhe na|

samcita (bsags pa)_ityādi sidhāntah | ālocanam (mthong ba) darśanam |

[Tillemans 1990: 65, 6–66, 4] §13. bye ba la nus pa cung zad tsam zhig ma dmigs nas tshogs pa la gnas pa la yang de dang mthun par brtag par ni rigs par 'gyur ro|| 'di ltar rtsa gcig la sha sbrang dang sbrang bu mchu rings la sogs pa'i rkang pa 'ching ba'i nus pa dmigs nas de dag gi tshogs pa la glang po che 'ching ba'i nus pa'i bar srid la| de bzhin du til rnams la re re la 'bru mar nyung zad tsam 'byin pa'i nus pa yod dang tshogs pa rnams la 'bru mar bum pa gang 'byin pa yang srid na tshogs pa la ma ltos pa'i dbang po'i rdul phra rab rnams la ni de ltar re re rnam par shes pa'i rten nyid du yod pa ma yin pas rdul phra rab la ltos nas kyang gnod pa mi srid do|| de'i phyir dbang po'i rdul phra rab la brten nas mig gi dbang po zhes bya ba rdul phra rab dag dang de nyid dang gzhan nyid rtogs pas stong pa rang gi **rnam par shes pa'i rten du gyur pa** brten nas brtags par 'jig rten par gyur pa yul la lta ba'i bya ba can zhig yod pa yin la de yang skad cig ma nyid kyi phyir rang gi rnam par shes pa dang lhan cig 'gags pas gnod pa ga la srid| de'i phyir shes pa gang zhig dbang po dang dbang po la gnas pa de ni mngon sum mo zhes bya ba mi rigs so||

vijñānasamudāya (rnam par shes pa'i rten du gyur pa) iti | cakṣuhśrotrādi-jñānasamūhah |

[Tillemans 1990: 67, 10–17] §16. gang yang 'dis dbang po'i rnam par shes pa 'di mngon sum nyid du **sgro btags nas** gzhan tshad ma nyid du rtog par byed pa de yang ches shin tu ma 'brel ba zhig go|| mi bslu ba'i shes pa ni 'jig rten na tshad ma nyid du mthong na rnam par shes pa yang bcom ldan 'das kyis 'dus byas yin pa'i phyir brdzun pa bslu ba'i chos can dang sgyu ma lta bur gsungs so|| gang zhig brdzun pa bslu ba'i chos can dang sgyu ma lta bu yin pa de ni mi

bslu ba ma yin te| rnam pa gzhan du gnas pa'i dngos po la rnam pa gzhan du snang ba'i phyir ro|| de lta bur gyur pa ni tshad ma nyid du brtag par rigs pa ma yin te| rnam par shes pa thams cad kyang tshad ma nyid du thal bar 'gyur ba'i phyir ro||

adhyāropya (*sgro btags nas*) svīkṛtya |

[Tillemans 1990: 67, 18– 68, 8] §17. de'i phyir rtog ge ba 'di gal te rtog ge'i chang 'thungs pas myos pas smyos par ma gyur na ni rten cing 'brel par 'byung ba dang brten nas btags pa zhes bya ba lam bzang po spangs nas mu stegs can gyi gzhung las bstan pa'i **dngos po** rnams gsal bar byed pa dam pa ma yin pa'i tshig 'khyal gyi tshogs ches brtol bar mi 'gyur ba zhig go|| 'jig rten 'di yang phal cher ma'i bzhin ltar dpyod cing 'jig rten dang 'jig rten las 'das pa'i dngos po gnas pa la rnam par rmongs pa 'dis rang gi rtog pa tsam gyis sbyar zhing mtho ris dang thar ba'i lam la bar du gcod par byed pa shin tu don med par rtog ge ba'i lam la bkod pa yin no|| de'i phyir 'dir smyo chu 'thungs pa ltar don med pa'i ngag 'khyal las bzlog par mi nus so|| spros pas chog go|| bum pa mngon sum yin pa bsal ba '**dis** ni mthong ba'i dbang po'i yul gyi dngos po thams cad mngon sum nyid yin pa bsal bar rig par bya'o||

ayam ('dis) iti tārkikāḥ | **padārtha** (? **dngos po** rnams)_iti svabhāvatvam vivakṣita |

Ad XIII.2

[Tillemans 1990: 68, 9–16] §18. ji ltar ji skad bshad pa'i tshul gyis bum pa **la sog pa** rnams mngon sum nyid yin par mi rigs pa de ltar de las gzhan pa'i dbang pos yongs su gead par bya ba brten nas gdags pa bsnam par bya ba dang myang bar bya ba dang reg par bya ba rnams mngon sum nyid yin pa bsal ba'i phyir bshad pa|

etenaiva vicārena sugandhi madhuram mrdu |
pratisedhayitavyāni sarvāny uttamabuddhinā || [XIII.2 (302)]¹⁾

1) Pras_LVP: 71, 8–9; Pras_M: 269, n. 1.

ādi (**la sog pa**)-śabdena kathayitavyādigrāhyam |

Ad XIII.7

[Tillemans 1990: 74, 5–16]

gal te mdog las dbyibs gzhan na||
ji lta bur na dbyibs 'dzin 'gyur|| [XIII.7 (307) ab]

§32. **sngon po la sogs pa'i** kha dog ni mig gi dbang po'i yul yin na| gal te de las dbyibs tha dad par 'gyur na ni kha dog las tha dad pa'i phyir sgra la sogs pa ltar mig gi gzung byar mi 'gyur ba zhig na| kha dog ltar mig gis 'dzin pa yang yin pas de las gzhan ma yin no|| ji ltar sngon po dang ser po la sogs pa tha dad pa rnams las gang yang rung ba cig bzung nas cig shos kyang 'dzin pa de ltar kha dog las gzhan pa'i gzugs ni mi 'dzin no||

añjanam̄ nīlāditvena (**sngon po la sogs pa**)_upalambhah̄ |

Ad XIII.8

[Tillemans 1990: 76, 1–8] §35. rdzas brgyad lhan cig 'byung bar nges pa 'byung ba chen po bzhi ma gtogs par gzugs mi dmigs la| gzugs kyi skye mched ma gtogs par yang gzugs kyi rgyu mi dmigs so|| **gzugs** kyi skye mched ni **mig** gi dbang pos gzung bar bya ba yin la| **gzugs** kyi rgyu ni **lus kyi dbang pos gzung bar bya ba** yin no|| de'i phyir gal te gzugs kyi rgyu zhes bya ba cung zad cig rang gi ngo bos 'grub par 'gyur na ni de'i tshe gzugs kyang rang gi ngo bos grub par 'gyur ba zhig na| gzugs kyi rgyu gzugs las tha dad par grub pa gang yin pa 'di ni srid pa yang ma yin no|| de'i phyir gzugs kyi rgyu med na rgyu med pa'i gzugs kyang yod pa ma yin no zhes bya bar grub bo||

rūpaviśaye indriyam rūpīndriyam | **cakṣur** (**mig**)-ādi | **rūpa** (**gzugs**)-ityādi **kāyendriya**^{118b1}-grāhyam (**lus kyi dbang pos gzung bar bya ba**) ityantena |

[Tillemans 1990: 76, 9–13] §36. ci ste 'o na ni tha dad pa ma yin par gnas pa'i gzugs kyi rgyu las gzugs yin par rag go snyam du sems na| de yang srid pa ma yin no||

gal te de ltar 'gyur na ni|| gnyi ga yang ni mig nyid kyis||

'dzin par ci yi phyir mi 'gyur|| [XIII.8 (308) cde]

parābhimatam anūdya | **tad yadi** (gal te)_ity uktam |

Ad XIII.10

[Tillemans 1990: 78, 15–18]

blta bya skyes pas bum pa ni||

'di la yon tan 'gar mi 'gyur||

des na blta bya nyid skye ltar||

yod pa'i ngo bo'ang yod ma yin|| [XIII.10 (310)]

[Tillemans 1990: 80, 8–13] §44. blta bar bya ba nyid skyes pa med pa

des na blta bya nyid skye ba ltar te|

ji ltar blta bar bya ba ma yin pa'i bum pa la rnam pa thams cad du blta bar bya ba nyid mi rigs pas skye ba mi srid pa de bzhin du blta bar bya bar ma gyur pa'i bum pa yod pa'i ngo bor yang yod pa ma yin la| yod pa yang ma yin pa'i bum pa la ni blta bar bya ba nyid brtag par rigs pa yang ma yin pas 'di ni mi rigs so||
dṛṣye (blta bya) padārthāntare **utpanne (skyes pa)** **dṛṣyatvam (blta bya nyid)**
nāma ghaṭavat sāmānyaviśeṣah |

Ad XIII.11

[Tillemans 1990: 81, 7–14] §47. gang gi tshe de ltar|

mig ni 'byung 'gyur rna de bzhin||

mig gis mthong gi gzhan gyis min || [XIII.11 (311) ab]

pa de'i tshe 'thad pa dang 'gal ba'i bya ba mi srid pa'i phyir mig la sogs pa rnams kyi rang gi ngo bo rtog pa ga la yod| 'byung ba las gyur pa nyid du mtshungs bzhin du yul 'dzin pa tha dad pa brtag par ni mi rigs so|| mig la sogs pa rnams kyi yod pa nyid ni yul 'dzin pa las rjes su dpog pa yin na de yang 'gal bas mi srid de de'i phyir dbang po yod pas yul rnams mngon sum nyid du mi rigs so||

netarat paśyati (mthong gi gzhan gyis min)_ity akṣamāyām |

Ad XIII.12

[Tillemans 1990: 84, 6–13] §54. 'dir smras pa| mig la sogs pa ni rang bzhin gyis yod pa nyid de| de'i 'bras bu rnam par shes pa **mthong ba'i phyir** ro|| bshad par bya ste| gal te de'i 'bras bu rnam par shes pa nyid yod na ni mig la sogs pa yod par 'gyur na srid pa ni ma yin no|| ji lta zhe na| de la re zhig |

rkyen ma tshang phyir shes pa ni||

lta ba'i snga rol yod ma yin||

'on te phyis na shes don med||

gsum par byed pa don med 'gyur|| [XIII.12 (312)]

darśanāc (**mthong ba'i phyir** ro) cakṣurvispharanāt | cakṣurālocanām cakṣurvyavalokanām | grahaṇena_itī sahārthe **tṛṭīyā (gsum par)** |

Ad XIII.14

[Suzuki 1994: 278, 4–5]

gatena na gunah kaścid rūpam dr̥stvāksi yāti cet |

draṣṭavyam niyamena_istam iti vā **jāyate vr̥thā** || [XIII.14 (314)]

...

[Suzuki 1994: 278, 11–280, 5] atha_адṛṣṭvā gacchati tadā didṛksita-visayadarśanam niyamena na prāpnoti ||| adrṣtvā hy andhasyevānabhilaksita-deśagamanād draṣṭavyasya niyamena da[r]śanam na prāpnoti |
 atha_адṛṣṭvā gacchati | tadā iṣṭam dravyam niyamena_itī (...vr̥thā_eva jāyate...) | avaśyam darśanam anupapatteḥ |

1) See also CŚ XI.10b (Suzuki 1994: 234, 12): niyamo jāyate vr̥thā.

Ad XIII.15

[Suzuki 1994: 278, 14–280, 5] athaitaddoṣaparijihīrṣayā yadi |||
grhnīyād agatañ cakṣuh paśyet sarvam idam jagat |
yasya nāsti gatis tasya nāsti dūram na cārvtam || [XIII.15 (315)]
 yo hi manyate (...cakṣuhśrotramano 'prāptavिषयam...¹⁾ ity āgamād **aprāpta-**viṣayam eva cakṣur iti tam praty ucyate | prāpta-**kāritāmātrapratiṣedhaparativād** āgamaśya tāvad avirodhah | kvacid vidheḥ prādhānyam yatra tasyāvirodhah | kvacit pratiṣedhasya prādhānyam yatra [tadavirodhah] | tad atra vidher asambhāt prāptakāritāpratiṣedhamātreṇāprāptavिषयatvam vyavasthāpyate |

(1) AbhiK I.43cd.

yady **aprāpta-kāritvam** nābhuyupagamyate | tadā **'gamavirodhah** |

Ad XIII.19

[Suzuki 1994: 284, 18–286, 10]

prāptaś ced grhyate śabdās tasya ādiḥ kena grhyate |
na caiti kevalah śabdo grhyate kevalah katham || [XIII.19 (319)]
 yady **śrotra**_indriyasthānam prāptah śabdo grhyate prāptagrāhitvāc **chrotrasya** śabdasyāder grahaṇam nāsti ||| na cānyad indriyam tasya grāhakaṁ sambhavatīti naiva kenacid asyādir grhyate ||| tataś cāgrhyamānatvāc chabda evāsau na bhavatī abhiprāyah |

navadravyakatvāc ca śabdaparamāṇoh | na caiti kevalah śabdah | bhavatā ca śabdāmātram eva śroṭreṇa grhyate na gandhādaya iti na yujyate | yad vā śabdasyāgraḥānam astu yad vā gandhādayo 'pi grhyantām ||| na caitad evam iti na prāptavिषayatvam śabdasya |

atha yad etad uktam

prāptaś ced grhyate śabdās tasya ādiḥ kena grhyate |||
 sa ca **prāpta**_ityādinā ^[2] niṣiddhaḥ | **agatvā¹⁾** _ity aprāpya | parāṇīty uṣṭāṇīti śeṣah | **ādiḥ** prathamam mukhanirgataḥ | paścāt kramena **śrotra**-deśam prāpnoti | **tasya**_iti mukhadeśasthasya |

1) *yadi cakṣuh paśyet tad rūpam paśyed viṣayadeśam vā gatvā paśyed agatvā vā* || ubhayatā [ca] doṣa iti pratipādayann āha (Suzuki 1994: 277, 3–4, ad CŚ XIII.13).

Ad XIII.21

[Suzuki 1994: 290, 6–11]

viyuktam indriyaś cittam kim gatvāpi [kari]syati | [XIII.21 (321) ab]
na hi cakṣurādīndriyadvāra-tiraskṛtasya_asya rūpādirdarśanasāmarthyam
asti || andhādīnām api darśanādisadbhāvaprasaṅgat |
athāpi kathamcid viṣayadeśagamanenārthopalabdhīr asya parika[ll]pyate
tadāpy aparyavasānatvād arthabodhasyānivṛttau satyām ||
cakṣurādīndriyadvāram tiraskṛtam paśya | asya_itи cittasya | anantatvād
arthāvabodhasyānivṛttāv ātmasthānāgamane |

Ad XIII.25

[Suzuki 1994: 304, 15–19] yathā cābhrāni vidūrataḥ parvatādyākāram
viparyāsam upajanayanti | evam aviduṣām yathāvat pratītyasamutpāda-
svabhāvākuśalānām avidyāviparyāsāksipta-karma-pratyayo vijñāna_ādi-
janmasāgarah sa bāhyena bhājane[nā] [jāyamāno 'lātacakrādivan?]ḥ
mr̥śāmoṣadharmaṅakah s[v]abhāvaśūnya eva san bālajanavisamvādakah
pratibhāti |
saṃskārāḥ karma | sa eva pratyayah | ādinā nāmarūpam | bāhyena
pṛthivyādinā saha bāhyam |

|| 13 ||

[End of the Chapter XIII]

Ad Chapter XIV

[D. 209a1-222a2; C. 206a1-219a2; P. 230b5-245a3; N. 236b5-252a6.]

Ad XIV.1

[Suzuki 1994: 312, 6–20]

āyattam yasya bhāvasya bhaven nānyatra kutracit |
sidhyet tasyāstītā nāma kvacit sa ca na vidyate || [XIV.1 (326)]
yadi hi kasyacit padārthasya niṣpattau kvacit kiṃcid āyattam na syāt
tadāśyāparāyattasya svatantrasya svata eva vyavasthitatvāt svabhāvato 'stityam
kalpayitum yuktam | na tv esa sambhavo 'sti yad dhetupratyayāyattajanmānām

parāyattatā na syād ahetuko vā padārthaḥ sambhaved iti | yataś caivam
nirhetukatvaprasaṅgāt kasyacit padārthasya kvacit svarūpam nāsti tasmān nāsti
kasyacit **svabhāvah** [] svabhāvābhāvāc cālātacakravan nāsti svabhāvasiddhir
iti sthitam |

yadi cāmī padārtha alātacakrādivad visamvādakā visamvādakatvād avastukā
na syus tadā niyatam upapattyā vicāryamānā jātarūpādīvat spaṣṭataram
upalabhyamānasvarūpāḥ syuh | na caite vicārāgnisamntāpitā
viparyāsanibandha[na]tvāt svarūpā bhāvam nāsādayanti | na hi vastūpapattyāpi
uyujate | sarvathā tasya visamvādakatvāt |

āyattam | āyattavam | ātmataḥ **svabhāvah** | **na syur** ity atra **yadi**_iti yojyam |

Ad XIV.4

[Suzuki 1994: 322, 1–13] atrāha vidyata eva ghaṭo guṇāśrayatvāt | na hy asad
guṇāśrayo drṣṭah | bhavati ca guṇāśrayo ghaṭa eko ghaṭo dvau ghaṭāv iti |
ekatva_ādayo **guṇapadārtha**_saṃgr̥hitā ghaṭāś ca dravyam [] dravya_
āśrayitvam ca guṇānām sambhavatīti [] ato guṇāśrayatvād asty eva ghaṭa iti |
atrocyeate | tvanmatena ||

eko yadi ghaṭo neṣṭo ghato 'py eko na jāyate || [XIV.4 (329) ab]

parārthabhedād yadi eko ghaṭo na bhavatītī manyase ghaṭo 'pi tarhy eko na
bhavati [] **yathā**_ekatvam **ekasamkhyā** ghaṭo na bhavaty evam
dravyatvena_ekasamkhyāyāḥ pṛthagbhūtāt vā ghaṭo 'py eko na bhavati []
dvitvādivad¹⁾ iti bhāvah | api cāsyaghaṭasya_ekarūpasya_ekasamkhyā
parikalpetānekarūpasya vā | yady ekarūpasya tadā vyarthaiavaikatvakalpanā |
athānekarūpasya tadāpi viruddhatvād ayuktaiva [] tasmāl loke
ghaṭasvarūpasyaivāsannihitārthāntarasya_ekakalpanā vijñeyā |

1) Reconstructed from Tib. *gnyis nyd la sogs pa bzhi* no for Skt. *dvitvād*.

^[3] **eka** iti **ekasamkhyā** yadi **ghaṭo** na bhavet | tato bhinna eva yadi ghaṭah
syāt tadā **ghaṭo** 'py **eka** iti **na** sidhyati | **padārthabhedāt** | **ekatva-**
guṇapadārthasya bhinnatvāt | **yathā dvitvādi** | **na**_ekam tadvat |

[Suzuki 1994: 322, 14–324, 9] atha dravyāśrayino guṇā iti kṛtvai katvayogād
ghaṭa evaiko bhavati na tv ekatvam [ghaṭo] bhavati | atrocyeate ||

na cāyam samayor yogas tenāpy eko na jāyate || [XIV.4 (329) cd]

yogo nāma **samayor** eva bhavati na viśamayoh [] + tatra_eko guṇo drṣṭo ghaṭāś
ca dravyam [] dravyaguṇayoś ca samatā yasmān na bhavati tasmāt taylor yoga
eva na bhavati | yogābhāvāt tatra yad iṣṭam ekatvayogād ghaṭa evaiko bhavat
tan na | yadi cātra yogo drṣṭas tadaikenāpi ghaṭasya yogah syād ghaṭenāpy

ekasya | sa ca naivam bhavatīti yoga evānayor nopapadyate | yogābhāvāc ca naivaiko ghaṭo bhavatīti na ghaṭo 'py eka iti | tad atra pūrvārthena kārikāyā yogam abhyupetya dūṣanām uktam ||| uttarārdhena tu yogāsambhave dūṣanām uktam | apiśabdaś ca dūṣaṇakāraṇasamuccayārtho draṣṭavyah |
samayor eva *ghṛtamadhu* **samyoge** saty **ekatvam** nānyatra | **ekasya** **samyogo** naiṣyate | gaṇe gaṇāntarābhāvāt |

Ad XIV.7

[Suzuki 1994: 330, 4–11]

ghaṭasya na bhavaty aikyam aprthaktvād dhi laksanaih |
ekaikasmin ghatābhāve **bahutvam** nopapadyate || [XIV.7 (332)]
 rūpādīni khalu nānālakṣaṇāni yeṣām tair aprthaktvām **ghaṭasya**_iṣṭam teṣām rūpādibhir lakṣaṇair aprthaktvād ghaṭasyaikyam **na**_upapadyate bahubhir ananyatvāt | **syāt** **tatra** matam yadi ghaṭasyaikyam na bhavati hanta **bahutvam** **prāptam** iti |
 atrocye | yasmād **rūpādiṣ** **ekaikasmin** **ghaṭasya**_abhāvo drṣṭas tasmād bahutvam **api** **nāsti** _iti |
syāt **tatra**_eva_ityādi **prāptam** ity antam paravacanam | **rūpādiṣu** madhye **ekaikasmin** rūpādau **ghaṭo** **na**_upalabhyate | ato **bahutvam** **api** **ghaṭasya** **nāsti** |

Ad XIV.6

[Suzuki 1994: 328, 1–5] iha ghaṭasattvayor vyāvṛttyanuvṛtti lakṣaṇam bruvatā ghaṭasya vyāvṛttilakṣaṇam vyavasthāpitam **pareṇa** ||| tad amunā lakṣaṇenāpi lakṣaṇasya nāsti siddhīḥ | na hi vyāvṛttimātreṇa śākyam vastusvarūpaṁ nirdhārayitum yal lakṣyatayā setsyati | ekas tāvad guṇatvād **ghaṭo** **na** **bhavati** | **param** ityādi^[4]nā vyākhyānāntaram āha | śuklaḥ paṭo na bhavati _iti guṇo guṇaḥ **ghaṭo** **na** **bhavati**_ity arthaḥ | śuklalakṣaṇaprāptah śuklasvarūpatām gataḥ | tadā ghaṭaḥ śuklatvam eva kevalam na ghaṭaḥ |

Ad XIV.8

[Suzuki 1994: 330, 12–332, 3] atrāha ||| yadi rūpādibhir lakṣaṇair aprthaktvād ghaṭasyaikam nāsti teṣām parasparasamyoगād ghaṭasyaikam bhaviṣyatīti | atrocye |||
na **hy** **asparśavato** **nāma** **yogah** **sparśavatā** **saha** |||
rūpādīnām ato **yogah** **sarvathāpi** **na** **yujyate** || [XIV.8 (333)]

tatra spr̄ṣṭih sparśah kāyendriyagrāhyatā sparśo 'syāstīti sparśavat | sprastavyam eva kāyendriyagrāhyatvāt sparśavat || tena sparśavatā spraṣṭavyena rūpagandharasānām asparśavatām yogah samyogah samsparśo na sambhavati || yathā ghaṭasyākāśena | + yata etad evam rūpādīnām ato yogah sarvaprakāram na sambhavati |

yadā ca na sambhavati tadānyonyasamsparśakṛtād rūpādīnām viśeṣat samudāyanibandhano ghaṭa iti yad uktam tan na yuktam |

vikalpāḥ viśeṣāḥ | nīlādiprabhṛtayo tathā jñeyāḥ |

Ad XIV.10

[Suzuki 1994: 334, 1–14]

sarveṣāṁ api rūpānām rūpatvam avilakṣanam |
ekasya ghatasadhbhāvo nānyesām kim nu kāraṇam || [XIV.10 (335)]

sarveṣāṁ api rūpānām iti rūpaskandhasamgrhitatvād rūpagandhādayo rūpānīty ucyate | tāni rūpāni ghaṭa iva paṭādiṣv api santi || na ca tāni ghaṭādibhede 'pi svalakṣaṇam vyabhicaranti | sarvatraiva tulyalakṣaṇatvāt | tatra yathaikasya rūpasya ghaṭatvenāvasthānam tathānyasyāpi paṭa_ādi-sambandhino rūpasya kasmād ghaṭatvenāvasthānam neṣyate | yujyate tu tasyāpi ghaṭatvenāvasthānam lakṣaṇābhedat | ghaṭāvasthititarūpādīvat | evam tv anabhyupagame kāraṇam eva na sambhavati | tataś ca sarveṣāṁ eva ghaṭatvam prāpnoti | ya[d vā] ghaṭasyāpi ghaṭatvam na prāpnoti | yathā ca ghaṭādīnām abhedaprasāṅga evam rūpagandhādīnām apy abhedāḥ prāpnoti | ekasmād ghaṭād ananyatvāt |

sarveṣāṁ nīlādi-rūpānām sambandha_abhāvena kena rūpeṇa ghaṭah paṭo bhavati |

Ad XIV.21

[Suzuki 1994: 348, 17–350, 11]

sad asat sadasac ceti sad asan neti ca kramah |
esa prayojo vidvadbhir ekatvādisu nityaśah || [XIV.21 (346)]

ekatvam anekatvam ubhayam nobhayam ity ekatvādayah | eteṣv ekatvādiṣv pakṣeṣu vādinā vyavasthiteṣu sadasattva_ādyupalakṣito dūṣaṇakramah sudhiyā yathākramam avatāryah | tatra satkāryavādinah kāryakāraṇayor ekatvam iti pakṣah | tasya hi kāraṇātmanā tat kāryam vyavasthitam eva sat kāryātmanā vipariṇamate | na hy asac chakyam kartum | yadi hy asann utpadyeta tadā sarvataḥ sarvasambhavaḥ syāt || na ca sarvataḥ sarvasambhavo drṣṭah | kṣīrāder eva pratiniyatadadhīdarśanāt || tad asya vādinaḥ

kāryakāraṇayor ekatvābhypagamāt sad eva kāryam utpadyata ity evam
ekatvapaksah [] tasminn ekatvapakṣe satkāryavādaparāmarśena nityam
dūṣanām abhidheyam |
sadasadbhyām iti **satvāsatva-vikalpābhyaṁ** **ekatva-anyatva-anyatva-**
lakṣaṇa-aprāptatvenāvastutvāt |

[Suzuki 1994: 354, 4–11] de la re zhig yul las ni gal te snam bu dang **dkar** po
dag gcig nyid yin na| gang dang gang na dkar po yod pa de dang de na **snam bu**
yang yod par 'gyur bar bya dgos so|| gang dang gang na snam bu yod pa de
dang de na dkar po yang yod par 'gyur bar bya dgos so|| ci ste gang dang gang
na dkar po yod pa de dang de na snam bu yod par mi 'gyur zhing | gang dang
gang na snam bu yod pa de dang de na dkar po yod par mi 'gyur na ni| [de la
snam bu dang dkar po dag gcig nyid yin no zhes gang 'dod pa de mi 'thad de|
yul tha dad pa'i phyir ro||

śuklaḥ (**dkar** **po**) śuklo na bhavati ^[5] tathā **paṭo** 'pi (**snam bu yang**) paṭo na
bhavaṭīti |

|| 14 ||

[End of the Chapter XIV]

Ad Chapter XV

[D. 222a2-230b2; C. 219a2-227b2; P. 245a3-254b4; N. 252a6-262b6.]

Ad XV.2

[Johnson 2012: 36, 15–37, 8] §5. *gzhan yang* |

'bras bu yis ni rgyu bshig pa||

des na med pa skye mi 'gyur|| [XV.2 (352) ab]

gang gi phyir myu gu skye bzhin pas rgyu sa bon zhes bya ba bshig pa de'i
phyir myu gu med pa kho na sa bon las skye'o zhes bya bar yang mi rigs so|| ji
ltar nas dang gro la sogs pa dag la yod pa ma yin pa'i sā lu'i myu gu de dag
rnam par 'gyur bas skye ba ma yin pa de bzhin du yod pa ma yin pas sā lu'i sa
bon **rnam par 'gyur bas** kyang skye ba ma yin pa zhig na 'bru mar 'byung na til
la sogs pa dag ltar myu gu skye ba na sa bon de 'jig pa yang yin no|| de'i phyir
med pa mi skye'o||

grub la sgrub byed yod ma yin||

de phyir yod pa'ang mi skye'o|| [XV.2 (352) cd]

grub zin pa'i myu gu ni slar 'grub pa ma yin pas yod pa yang mi skye'o||
bhinnam vikṛtam (*rnam par 'gyur bas*) | na hy asatā kiñcit vikriyate |

Ad XV.5

[Johnson 2012: 39, 4–11] ci ste skye ba'i dus na skye ba yin la gnas pa'i dus na|
gnas pa yin zhing 'jig pa'i dus na 'jig pa'o snyam du| 'di yang mi rigs te| 'di ltar|
gnyis gnyis dag ni med pa ru||
j i ltar re re rtsom par 'gyur|| [XV.5 (355) cd]

'dir skye ba'i dus na gnas pa dang mi rtag pa gnyis med pas gnas pa dang | 'jig
pa dang bral ba'i 'dus byas nyid med pa'i phyir skye bar yang mi 'gyur ro|| de
bzhin du gnas pa'i dus dang 'jig pa'i dus su yang gnyis gnyis dag med par re re
'jug pa mi srid do|| de med pas 'dus byas ma yin no||

dvābhȳām (gnyis dag) iti sthitivināśābhȳām |

Ad XV.13

[Johnson 2012: 47, 12–21] gzhan yang mtshan nyid 'di rnames '**byung ba** na
mtshan gzhi las tha dad pa'i ngo bo can zhig gam tha mi dad pa zhig mtshan
nyid kyi las la 'jug grang na| de la re zhig |

mtshan las mtshan gzhi gzhan zhe na||

mtshan gzhi mi rtag nyid ga las|| [XV.13 (363) ab]

ji ltar tsha ba dang grang ba dang bde ba dang sdug bsngal ba la sogs pa dag
gcig la gcig med par 'gyur bas gzhan nyid du gnas pa de bzhin du mtshan gzhi
yang mtshan nyid las tha dad par 'jug pa ni mi rtag pa nyid med par yang 'byung
bar 'gyur na| 'dus byas ni mi rtag pa'i phyir mi rtag pa nyid med par 'byung ba
ma yin pas 'di'i gzhan nyid mi rigs so||

ekasya (gcig la)_ity utpatteḥ | **janma** ('**byung ba**)-Śabdena_utpādaḥ |

Ad XV. 15

[Johnson 2012: 50, 6–14] §25. 'di las kyang yod pa ma yin te| skye ba dang 'jig
pa dag mi rigs pa'i phyir ro|| 'dir skye ba'i **dngos po'i rang bzhin gyi** don nam
dngos po med pa'i rang bzhin la rtog grang na| de bzhin du 'jig pa yang rtog pa
na| dngos po 'am **dngos po med pa** zhig la rtog grang na| rnam pa thams cad du
mi srid do zhes bstan pa'i phyir bshad pa|

dngos po dngos por mi 'gyur te||

dngos med dngos por mi 'gyur ro||

dngos med dngos med mi 'gyur te||

dngos yod dngos med mi 'gyur ro|| [XV.15 (365)]

asadbhāva (dngos po med pa) iti | **bhāvarūpasya** (dngos po'i rang bzhin gyi)_iti
śesah |

Ad XV.19

[Suzuki 1994: 364, 1–6] atrāha | naivārdhajāto jāyamāno yato yathopavarṇita-
doṣaprasāṅgah syāt | kiṁ tarhi [] yasya **nirodhe**[na] **jātaḥ** padārtho bhavati sa
jāteḥ **prāgavasthārūpo** 'rtho jāyamāna ity ucyata iti tad eva pratipādayann āha ||
jāyamānanirodhena jāta utpadyate yataḥ |
tato 'nyasyāpi sadbhāvo jāyamānasya dr̄ṣyate || [XV.19 (369)]

nirodha_anantaram yo jātas tu **prāgavasthā** pūrvākoṭih | tata rūpo 'rtho
jātaḥ **prāgavasthārūpah** | etac ca yathā kathañcit pracchādanamātram
parasya |

Ad XV.20

[Suzuki 1994: 364, 9–19] atrocyate ||

jāto yadā tadā nāsti jāyamānasya sambhavah | [XV.20 (370) ab]
yadā tāvad ayam padārtho jāta ity ucyate tadā jāyamāno nāsti []
jāyamānāsambhavāc ca jāta ity eva nāsti | ato jātena jāyamāno **'numīyeta** |
atha jāto 'pi jāyamānah syāt | **tasya tarhy** utpādāsambhavo jātavād iti
pratipādayann āha ||

jāta utpadyate kasmāj jāyamāno yadā tadā || [XV.20 (370) cd]
yadā jāta **eva**_artho jāyamāna ity ucyate tadā sa **jāyamāno** 'rthaḥ **kasmād**
utpadyata iti parikalpyate [] siddhatvād utpādaparikalpo 'syā na yukta ity
abhiprāyah [] tataś ca jāyamāno jāyata iti na yujyate |
anumīyeta_ity atra pareneti śesah | **tasya tarhi**_iti | **jāyamānasya** |
jāta jāyamā^[6]nayor abhedād ity arthaḥ | **jāta** **eva**_utpanna eva **yadā**
jāyamāna ity ucyate | **tadā** **jāyamānah** | **kasmād** utpadyata ity ucyate |

Ad XV.21

[Suzuki 1994: 366, 1–13] atrāha | janmābhimukhatvād ajāto 'pi jāyamāno jāta
ity ucyate | tataś ca jāta eva jāyamāno na cāsyotpādavaiyarthym iti | evam api
yadi ||

ajāto jāta ity eva **jāyamānah** **krtah** **kila** || [XV.21 (371) ab]
yady **ajāta** eva **jāyamānah** padārtho janmābhimukhyāt pareṇa jāta iti kalpitah |
jātājātaylor
bhedābhāvād **ghato** 'bhāvas **tadā** **kim** na **vikalpyate** || [XV.21 (371) cd]

jātāvastha eva hi padārtho ghaṭa ity abhidhīyate | jātājātayoś caikyāt **prāg abhāvena** jāto 'pi ghaṭo 'bhāva eveti syāt || na caitat sambhavatiḥ ayuktam etat | athāpi syāt | **naiva jāyamānājātayor [bh]edābhāvah** |
jāyata ity asyānte ity arthaḥ **syād** iti yojyam | sa ca na yujyate |
jāyamāno 'jāto yah sa **jāta** ity **evam** kutah | **prāg abhāvena** | pūrvam abhāvarūpatvena | **naiva bhedābhāva** iti | bheda eva_ity arthaḥ |

Ad XV.22

athāpi syāt | **naiva jāyamānājātayor [bh]edābhāvah** | utpattikriyāviśyamāno hi padārtho jāyamāna ity ucyate || **sa ca** ||
anispanno 'py ajātāt tu jāyamāno bahiskrtah || [XV.22 (372) ab]
yady apy anāgatād anispannātūpo 'pi padārtho jāyamāno bahir vyavasthāpitah |
tathāpi jāya[te 'jā]to yato jātād bahiskrtah || [XV.22 (372) cd]
sa ca_ityādi siddhāntah |

Ad XV.25

[Suzuki 1994: 370, 10–372, 14]

kāranavyatirekena yadā kāryam na vidyate |
pravr̄ttiś ca nivṛttiś ca tadā naivopapadyate || [XV.25 (375)]
yadā kāraṇāt pṛthagbhūtaṁ kāryam vicāryamāṇam na sambhavati tadā
nirāśrayā pravṛttiḥ kāryasyotpādo nivṛttiḥ ca kāraṇasya vināśaś ca na vidyate |
tad evam parīkṣyamāṇā bhāvāḥ svabhāvasiddhā na bhavantīti saiva
māyopamatāvāsiyate bhāvānām |
tad enām bālalāpīnīm māyām vyāmūḍhajanasammohanīm amūḍhajana-
vismayakarīm avetya vidhūyedamsatyābhiniveśasamutthām padārthatrṣṇām
sakalajagadanugrahāya mahākaruṇābodhicittādvajajñānatrayam anuttara-
jñānodayabījabhūtam abhimukhīkṛtya yathāvadasitasaṁsārasvabhāvah
kleśaduḥkhāgnijvālāvalīdhabhuvanatrayāgāramadhyagatam atrāṇam jagad
īkṣamāṇah piṇḍikṛtāśeṣajagadvyasanasampātaiḥ kṣaṇe kṣaṇe 'nyathā cānyathā
cāsaṁsāram api kāyacetasor upanipatadbhir apy **akātarō** yugapat-
piṇḍikṛtāśeṣajagadduhkhopanipātair āsaṁsāram **samutsāhita_ekaikavīrya-**
kṣaṇah sakalasya jagataḥ sarvākārajñatājñānaratnadhananicayodayakāraṇam
viduṣo bhavotpattriḥ ity avetya sarvākārajñatājñānodayena sakalasya jagataḥ
saṁvibhāgam cikīrṣatā **punar** api **yuktam** **bhavam** upāttum iti ||
akātarō bhavatīti kṛyā yojyā kiṁbhūtaḥ **samutsāhita** utpādita **eko** bīja-
kṣaṇo yasya | tena ca **punar a^[7]'pi bhavam** utpādayitum **yuktam** |

|| 15 ||

[End of the Chapter XVI]

Ad Chapter XVI

[D. 230b3-239a5; C. 227b2- 236a4; P. 254b4-264a3; N. 262b7-273b3.]

Ad XVI.1

[Suzuki 1994: 380, 2–6] [sa]manukrāntaiḥ pañcadaśabhiḥ prakaranaiḥ śāstrakāryam parisamāpya śāstrārambhaprayojanam kṛtvānyāśeṣaparihāram copadarśayan ṣoḍaśam prakaranam ārabhate ||

kenacid dhetunā śūnyam aśūnya iva dr̄syate |

tasya prakaranaih sarvaih pratisedho vidhīyate || [XVI.1 (376)]

[Suzuki 1994: 381, 3–6] **da ni** thal zin pa'i rab tu byed pa bco Ingas bstan bcos kyi bya ba yongs su rdzogs par byas nas bstan bcos rtsom pa'i dgos pa dang | rgol ba ngan pa'i lhag ma spangs par bstan pa'i phyir rab tu byed pa bcu drug pa rtsom mo ||

tasyām (da ni?)¹⁾ iti śūnyatāyām |

1) Missing in Skt. See Suzuki 1994: 381, n. 2.

Ad XVI.2

[Suzuki 1994: 382, 4–10] yady evam artham **esām** prakaranānām ārambho nanv ata evaśūnyatvam siddham bhāvānām | tathā hy eṣām prakaranānām vaktā tā[vad bhavān asti | prakaran]||*****|[hetuvy]āvartako hetur asti | vacanam cedam prativiśiṣṭārthakṛtāvadhidhvaniśamudāyarūpam **pañcadaśa**-prakarana_ātmakam astīti vak[tr]vācyavacanānām sadbhāvāt siddham aśūnyatvam bhāvānām iti vyartha eva bhavataḥ sarvaprakaranāprārambhapariśramāyāsa iti pratipādayann āha ||

yadā vaktāsti vācyāñ ca na [śūnya] + + + + | [XVI.2 (377) ab]

[Suzuki 1994: 383, 15–384, 13]

gang tshe smra po brjod bya na'ang | [XVI.2 (377) a]

[de'i tshe]

stong pa zhes byar mi rung ngo | [XVI.2 (377) b]

'ang gi sgra ni tshig bsdu ba'i don du'o|| gang gi tshe khyod smra ba po yod cing | brjod par bya ba rab tu byed pa bco Ingas bstan par bya ba'i don yod la khyod kyi tshig stong pa nyid kyi don rab tu sgrub par byed pa yang yod pa de'i tshe dngos po thams cad grub bo|| mo gsham gyi bu yod pa ma yin pa ni don gang

gi yang smra ba por mi rigs shing | de'i tshe tshig kyang yod pa ma yin la de'i tshig gis bstan par bya ba'i don yang med na 'di gsum ni yod pa yang yin pas dngos po rnams rang bzhin dang bcas pa nyid du grub bo||

bshad par bya ste| 'di ni rigs pa yang ma yin no|| gang las she na 'di ltar|

gang zhig brten nas kun 'byung ba||

de ni gsum la'ang yod ma yin|| [XVI.2 (377) cd]

rang bzhin bya ba ni tshig gi lhag ma'o|| 'di na smra ba po gang yin pa de yang kho bo cag gi ltar na rten cing 'brel bar 'byung ba yin dang smra ba po nyid du rnam par gzhag ste| tshig dang brjod par bya ba la brten nas smra ba por 'dogs kyi mi smra ba ni ma yin no|| gang gi tshe de lta yin pa de'i tshe smra ba po la smra ba'i rang bzhin med la tshig dang brjod par bya ba la yang smra ba po'i rang gi ngo bo yod pa ma yin no|| gal te yod na ni skye bo don med pa nyid du 'gyur ro| de'i phyir smra ba po'i rang bzhin rang ngam de la med de| de'i phyir stong pa yin no||

pañcadaśa ca parimāṇam **eśām** iti trayan na (?) |

Ad XVI.6 (?)

[D 232a5–6] 'dir smras pa| **khyod kyis** stong pa nyid kyis gcig nyid la sogs pa'i phyogs thams cad mi rigs par brjod do||

gang du mngon sum gyis bum der||

stong pa'i gtan tshigs don med 'gyur|| [XVI.6 (381) ab]

tvayā hi (**khyod kyis**)_iti parah |

Ad XVI.12 (?)

[D 234a3–4] 'di ltar|

gal te kun la gnyis min na|| [XVI.12 (387) a]

rnam par dpyad bzhin pa yi don||

gzhan gang zhig la yod dngos yod||

gal te khyod la'ang de rigs na||

rgal ba gzhan po ci ste byed|| [XVI.12 (387) bcd]

yasmāt karaṇāt samjñā vidyate atāḥ **sadvastv asti** (yod dngos yod)_iti jñeyam |

|| 16 ||

/End of the Chapter XVI/

Catuhṣatakam ||

Addendum
to the Bibliography and Abbreviations

- Katano, Michio 片野道雄. 1980. “Daijō bukkyō to ta shisō tono tairon: Gesshō zō Shihyakuron shaku hahensitsu hon wo chūshin ni 大乘仏教と他思想との対論: 月称造四百論釈破辯執品を中心に.” *Bukkyō shisōshi* 佛教思想史 2: 53–91.
- Johnson, Dennis A. 2012. *Refuting the Conditioned – The Saṃskṛtartha-pratiṣedha of Candrakīrti’s Catuhśatakaṭīkā: Introduction, Translation and Summary together with a Critical Edition of the Tibetan Translation.* Diplomarbeit, University of Vienna. Philologisch-Kulturwissenschaftliche Fakultät, accessed May 1, 2017. http://theses.univie.ac.at/20891/1/2012-06-11_0207577.pdf
- May, Jacques. 1980. “Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la permanence (I).” In *Indianisme et Bouddhisme, Mélanges offerts à Mgr Etienne Lamotte* (Louvain: Publications de l’Institut orientaliste de Louvain): 215–232.
- . 1981a. “Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la permanence (II).” *Bulletin de l’Ecole française d’Extrême-Orient* 69 (à la mémoire de Paul Demiéville): 75–96.
- . 1981b “Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la permanence (III).” *Études asiatiques* 35 (2) (*Hommage à Constantin Regamey*): 47–76.
- . 1982. “Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la permanence (IV).” *Etudes de Lettres, University of Lausanne* 3: 45–76.
- . 1984. “Āryadeva et Candrakīrti sur la permanence (V)” *Acta Indologica, Studies of Mysticism in honor of the 1150th Anniversary of Kōbō Daishi’s Nirvāṇam* (Narita: Naritasan Shinshoji): 115–144.
- Ogawa, Ichijō 小川一乗. 1977. “Jikanron ni taisuru daijōbukkyō teki siten: Gesshō zō Shihyakuron shaku dai 11 shō haji hon no kaidoku 時間論に対する大乘仏教的視点：月称造『四百論釈』第十一章「破時品」の解説.” *Otani daigaku kenkyū nenpō* 大谷大學研究年報 29: 1–53.
- . 1988. “Shihyakuron shaku dai 10 shō haga hon no kaidoku 『四百論釈』第十章「破我品」の解説.” In *Kūshō sisō no kenkyū II: Chandorakīruthi*

- no chūgan setsu* 空性思想の研究II—チャンドラキールティの中観説—
(Kyoto: Buneidō shoten): 98–133.
- Sasaki, Esshō 佐々木惠精. 1993. “Kyokutan he no toraware: Shihyakuron oyobi shakuron dai 14 shō no kenkyū 極端への執らわれ: 『四百論』及び『釈論』第十四章の研究.” *Kyoto joshi daigaku shūkyō bunka kenkyūjo kiyō* 京都女子大学宗教・文化研究所研究紀要 6: 17-40. (URI: <http://hdl.handle.net/11173/1903>)
- . 1994. “Kyokutan he no toraware (2): Shihyakuron oyobi shakuron dai 14 shō no kenkyū 極端への執らわれ(二): 『四百論』及び『釈論』第十四章の研究.” *Kyoto joshi daigaku shūkyō bunka kenkyūjo kiyō* 京都女子大学宗教・文化研究所研究紀要 7: 23-36. (URI: <http://hdl.handle.net/11173/1906>)
- . 1996. “Kyokutan he no toraware (3): Shihyakuron oyobi shakuron dai 14 shō no kenkyū 極端への執らわれ(三): 『四百論』及び『釈論』第十四章の研究.” *Kyoto joshi daigaku shūkyō bunka kenkyūjo kiyō* 京都女子大学宗教・文化研究所研究紀要 9: 197-216. (URI: <http://hdl.handle.net/11173/1912>)
- Sasaki, Esshō 佐々木惠精 & Uno, Ekyō 宇野惠教. 1988. “Ātoman ni matsuwaru ronsō: Shihyakuron Gesshō shaku no wayaku kenkyū (2) アートマンにまつわる論争: 『四百論』月称釈の和訳研究 (II).” *Bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 仏教学研究 44: 1-39.
- . 1991. “Ātoman ni matsuwaru ronsō: Shihyakuron Gesshō shaku no wayaku kenkyū (3) アートマンにまつわる論争: 『四百論』月称釈の和訳研究 (III).” *Bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 仏教学研究 47: 17–69.
- Tillemans, Tom, J. F. 1990a. *Materials for the study of Āryadeva, Dharmapāla and Candrakīrti, The Catuhśataka of Āryadeva, Chapter XII and XIII, with the commentaries of Dharmapāla and Candrakīrti: Introduction, Sanskrit, Tibetan and Chinese Texts, Notes.* Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde, Heft 24, 2. Wien, vol. I. Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien, Universität Wien.
- . 1990b. *Materials for the study of Āryadeva, Dharmapāla and Candrakīrti, The Catuhśataka of Āryadeva, Chapter XII and XIII, with the*

- commentaries of Dharmapāla and Candrakīrti: Introduction, Sanskrit, Tibetan and Chinese Texts, Notes.* Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde, Heft 24, 2. Wien, vol. II: Texts and Indexes. Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien, Universität Wien.
- Uno, Ekyō 宇野惠教. 1983. “Shihyakuron Gesshō saku no wayaku kenkyū (1) 『四百論』月称作の和訳研究(I)” *Bukkyōgaku kenkyū 仏教学研究* 41: 79–104.
- . 1998. “Ātoman ni matsuwaru ronsō: Shihyakuron Gesshō shaku no wayaku kenkyū (4) アートマンにまつわる論争: 『四百論』月称釈の和訳研究(IV).” *Bukkyōgaku kenkyū 仏教学研究* 54: 1–38.
- Yamaguchi, Susumu 山口益. 1965. “Gesshō zō Shihyakuron chūshaku: hajō hon no kaidoku 月称造『四百論註釈』「破常品」の解読.” In: *Yamaguchi susumu bukkyōgaku bunshū* 山口益仏教学文集 (Tokyo: Shunjū sha), vol. 2: 349–403.
- Yonezawa, Yoshiyasu. 2018. “**Lakṣaṇaṭīkā* Sanskrit Notes on the *Catuhśatakaṭīkā* (4).” *JNIBS* 41: 73–92.